



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE  
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING**

**MINUTES**

Monday, February 14, 2022

Scottsdale Fire Station 602 Community Room  
7522 E Indian School Rd  
Scottsdale, AZ 85251

**PRESENT:** Emily Hinchman, Chair  
Janice Shimokubo, Vice-Chair  
Marty Day  
James Eaneman  
Hannellie Mendoza  
Stuart Rhoden  
Lawdan Shojaee (arrived at 5:05 p.m.)

**STAFF:** Jackie Johnson, Diversity Program Director  
Kelly Corsette

**Call to Order/Roll Call**

Chair Hinchman called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

**Public Comment**

No public comments were submitted.

**1. Approval of minutes from the January 10, 2022 meeting**

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE JANUARY 10, 2022 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. VICE-CHAIR SHIMOKUBO SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONER SHOJAEI WAS NOT PRESENT. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

## **2. Introduction of the City of Scottsdale's Diversity Program Director**

Diversity Program Director Jackie Johnson introduced herself and briefly talked about her background.

## **3. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendations regarding Scottsdale Police Department's 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter, 2021 and Annual 2021 Hate crimes and bias related incident reports**

Detective Garrett Wieger reviewed bias crime statistics, including specific biases, during calendar year 2021. He reported on three bias-related earlier in the year. During the fourth quarter of 2021, two bias-related incidents were reported. One incident relating to African American slang terms being written in sharpie on a drainage grate, occurred on October 22, 2021. The criminal damage had been painted over by the time the Department received the report. Another incident, reported on November 23, 2021 was a swastika and foul language on the shed of a self-service car wash. The report was delayed in being reported and no suspects were identified. These two incidents bring the total number of bias-related incidents documented in 2021 to five. No reported incidents reached the level of an actual hate crime.

Commissioners were given an opportunity to ask questions. Detective Wieger said that he suspects that the reason for such a low hate crime rate in comparison to the rest of the Valley and the country is due to the citizenry that live in Scottsdale. He said that of the two incidents he mentioned, the first one occurred in northern Scottsdale, around 100th Street and Indian Bend and the other occurred in southern Scottsdale, around 4100 82nd Street.

Detective Wieger explained that the Scottsdale police department does not have a program marketing the city's intolerance for hate crimes and/or to educate youth outside of the efforts of the school resource officers. Commissioner Rhoden suggested that Chief Walther might consider including hate crime education as part of his shop talks program.

## **4. Discussion and possible recommendations regarding Scottsdale Unified School District Superintendent, Dr. Scott A. Menzel's presentation from the January 10, 2022 meeting regarding the December 9, 2021 letter to SUSD parents and subsequent student enrollment issue**

Mr. Corsette said that Mayor and Council did not offer any follow-up comments or questions relating to the letter sent to SUSD parents.

Chair Hinchman said that Dr. Menzel recently reached out to her regarding the situation with Afghan students. The same group that was vocal about the gender clubs is trying to prevent the Afghan refugees from going to Scottsdale schools. Since that call, SUSD has received support from the City regarding the refugees. There are approximately 300 refugees in Scottsdale waiting for permanent housing, with 20 having been already placed.

Director Johnson said that she, Chair Hinchman, and Mayor Ortega recently participated in a meeting with the IRC to hear about what has been happening. They noted that the situation has improved with the support of the City and community members.

Chair Hinchman noted that she, Director Johnson, and Vice-Chair Shimokubo also participated in a meeting with the head of the Islamic Speakers Bureau. The bureau is working with the IRC and a task force and have offered their support to Dr. Menzel.

## **5. Presentation, discussion and possible recommendations regarding the Human Relations Commission's 2022 Strategic Initiatives**

Chair Hinchman invited each Commissioner to provide a PowerPoint slide regarding goals, recommended tactics, and a timeline for priority initiatives.

- a. Goals, recommended tactics, and timeline for priority initiatives:
  - i. Continue Community Town Hall

Commissioner Rhoden presented his recommended goals and tactics for continuing with the Community Town Hall program. He recommended holding three additional Town Halls by the end of calendar year 2022.

Goals included hosting Town Halls on the following timeline:

- June 2022 – LGBTQ+ Anti-Discrimination entitled “How Does it Feel to be a Problem?”
- September – a teen town hall with one to two representatives from each Scottsdale high school. Students would be asked to choose the topic.
- November – political discourse and civil engagement session entitled “Can We Get Along?”

Key tactics would include:

- Identifying speakers, panelists, or moderators,
- Determining dates and locations, and
- Utilizing a variety of promotional opportunities, to include creating a logo and social media presence.

The timeline would be the second, third, and fourth quarter of 2022.

Chair Hinchman noted that Commissioner Shojaee will be working on the Town Halls too. After consulting with Mr. Corsette and Mr. Stockwell, it was decided to alternate Town Hall leads.

Commissioner Shojaee presented her recommended goals and tactics for continuing with the Community Town Hall program. She briefly discussed the information, noting that additional consideration needs to be given to the tactics before moving forward with an official list.

Goals included:

- Increase engagement at Town Halls, especially with youth
- Advocate and promote all dimensions of diversity in town halls
- Link Town Halls to other civic and community events
- Conduct one Town Hall per quarter
- Partner with Scottsdale Unified School District (SUSD) and local non -profits
- Take action to increase attendance

Key tactics would include:

- Create a public calendar with upcoming Town Hall dates
- Connect with local non-profits and SUSD
- Work with marketing team to promote Town Halls

Commissioners were given an opportunity to make comments. Vice-Chair Shimokubo wondered if four town halls in one year might be an overextension. She suggested doing a post-mortem following Town Hall sessions to determine how effective they have been and how many people are attending. Director Johnson agreed that a post-mortem done about every three months would be helpful.

Discussion ensued regarding public initiatives, encouraging a diverse attendance representation, identifying insights that are coming out of the Town Halls, the possibility of interchanging Town Halls with Dinner and Dialogue sessions, and the potential for finding alternate ways to engage and educate the community.

It was suggested that the community survey results could be used to help glean potential topics for whatever format is used. Mr. Corsette said that the next community survey will be conducted at the end of 2022.

Commissioners Shojaee and Rhoden will work with staff over the next month to fine-tune the plan for the Town Hall program. An item to further discuss the topic will be included on the March meeting agenda.

ii. Scottsdale's Anti-Discrimination Ordinance Follow-up

Commissioner Eaneman presented his recommended goals and tactics for Scottsdale's Anti-Discrimination Ordinance (ADO) follow up.

Goals included:

- To build and deliver a comprehensive internal and external communications effort to create an awareness of both the Human Relations Commission and the Scottsdale Anti-Discrimination Ordinance

Key tactics would include:

- To work with Mr. Corsette and Director Johnson to develop a presentation for City employees.
- Develop a presentation for Scottsdale citizens and HRC community partners.
- Compose and deliver background pieces for news outlets.
- Hold off-site Human Relations Commission meetings and make Anti-Discrimination Ordinance presentations during those meetings.

Commissioners were given an opportunity to make comments. It was suggested that the promotional program could be launched in correlation with the anniversary of the ADO.

Mr. Corsette said that additional research would need to be done before launching an ADO program directed to City staff. Up to this point, there has been general publicity and awareness of the ADO, but no required staff training specific to the ADO. He noted that at this time with the hybrid meeting environment, it would be difficult to hold regular Commission meetings at varying locations.

It was the consensus of the Commission to move forward with the Scottsdale Anti-Discrimination Ordinance follow-up as outlined by Commissioner Eaneman.

iii. Conduct diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) research

Commissioner Day presented her recommended goals and tactics for conducting diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) research.

Goals included:

- Follow Arizona law/senate/house actions related to DEI and make recommendations.
- Collect Scottsdale immigration data.
- Collect statistical information on bias-related crimes, their frequency, and outcomes for the City, state and nationally.

Key tactics would include:

- Meeting with the new City Government Relations Director to discuss Arizona activities in the Legislature and what we need to focus on as a Commission.
- Obtain Scottsdale immigration and census data from City Long Range Planning and report to the Commission.
- Communicate with other cities to determine how they handle their bias-related crimes.

Commissioners were given an opportunity to make comments. It was noted that the original intent behind this initiative was to educate the Human Relations Commission and broaden awareness and understanding so the Commission could better advise City Council. It was noted that immigration is not under the scope of the commission; prejudice would be.

It was Consensus of the Commission to move forward with conducting diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) research as outlined by Commissioner Day.

iv. Identify important critical diversity issues in Scottsdale using trends and metrics

Commissioner Mendoza presented her recommended goals and tactics for identifying important critical diversity issues in Scottsdale using trends and metrics.

Goals included:

- Using data from the National Community Survey (NCS) to identify and prioritize diversity issues in Scottsdale in relation to the 2022 HRC initiatives.
- Obtain qualitative data for trends being tracked for in-depth analysis of what is driving the data and trends.

- Chronicle the growth and development of different groups in Scottsdale as a source of information for Human Relations Commission initiatives and programs.
- Promote awareness and understanding among different demographic groups.

Key tactics would include:

- Maintain up-to-date data on Scottsdale demographics for all Commissioners.
- Obtain historical data on different ethnic groups in Scottsdale, including gender, age, and business statistics.
- Study a partnership with StoryCorps – one-step project to promote deep awareness and understanding of different groups.

Commissioner Day suggested moving immigration data from the conduct diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) research goal to the identify important critical diversity issues goal.

Mr. Corsette clarified that the community survey is a set list of questions with little room for custom questions and if the Commission wishes to add questions, it could be in competition with other departments for spots on the survey. He mentioned, regarding the focus group initiative, that the City is working on the possibility of a Harvard fellow coming on board with the city over the summer. The proposal they are looking for is for someone to help dig into the last community survey data and determine whether holding focus groups would be beneficial.

It was Consensus of the Commission to move forward with the identifying important critical diversity issues in Scottsdale using trends and metrics as outlined by Commissioner Mendoza.

v. Develop stronger community partnerships

Chair Hinchman presented her recommended goals and tactics for developing stronger community partnerships.

Goals included:

- Ensure that community partners are aware of the Human Relations Commission and what they do.
- Develop new partnerships and continue existing partnerships

Key tactics would include:

- Invite a different partner to present at each Human Relations Commission meeting.
- Ask partners to work with, sponsor, and/or attend HRC planned events.
- Offer to attend partner meetings and share the HRC mission.
- Work with ADO commissioner on ensuring partners are aware of non-discrimination and promote inclusion/diversity.

It was the consensus of the Commission to move forward with developing stronger community partnerships as outlined by Chair Hinchman.

vi. Enhance Marketing messaging and Social Media Presence

Mr. Corsette gave an update on efforts being made by staff to enhance marketing messaging and social media presence. Staff is developing the Scottsdale For All communications plan and are moving forward to elevate the program on a more regular basis, in hopes of making it a more common point of knowledge in the community. He encouraged Commissioners to let him know if they find something interesting that they feel should be shared from a communications perspective.

Discussion ensued regarding partnering with One Community to promote the Scottsdale for All campaign. Mr. Corsette said that he and Director Johnson will follow up with One Community regarding promoting Arizona cities who have adopted anti-discrimination ordinances.

**6. Updates, discussion, and possible recommendations regarding recent and upcoming diversity and inclusion-related activities and incidents impacting the City of Scottsdale**

Chair Hinchman initiated a discussion regarding the Town Halls and Commissioners increasing communication with their networks, with the goal of having a more diverse audience. Discussion included a review of the attendance numbers for the past Town Hall sessions, inclusion of civically-minded teens, promotional tools, and defining what “success” is.

Chair Hinchman gave a recap of the recent Regional HRC meeting. She mentioned that Fountain Hills has recently opened a diversity department and established a commission. Commissioners gave input on the structure of the Regional HRC meeting. They commented that they felt lectured by the keynote speaker and would have liked the breakout groups to have been assigned a leader to start the conversations.

Commissioners talked about their experience participating in the 2022 Parada del Sol. Mr. Corsette said the LOVE float is part of the Scottsdale for All promotional efforts. He hopes to have an improved version of the float ready in time for the next Pride Parade.

Mr. Corsette gave an update on the Juneteenth event planning. The City is scheduled to do a walk-through next week. the City and Scottsdale Arts will be co-presenters of the event. He mentioned that Scottsdale Arts has mentioned including an educational component. He will update the Commission as opportunities for involvement present themselves.

**7. Identification of Future Agenda Items**

Upcoming meetings will include:

- 2022 Strategic Initiatives – Community Town Hall

The next meeting is scheduled for March 14, 2022.

**8. Adjournment**

COMMISSIONER RHODEN MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER EANEMAN SECONDED THE MOTION. NO VOTE WAS TAKEN.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 6:53 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.