

---

This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the September 13, 2016 City Council Regular Meeting and **has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.**

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2016-agendas/091316RegularAgenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<http://www.Scottsdaleaz.gov/Scottsdale-video-network/council-video-archives/2016>.

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed "time stamps" [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 480-312-2411.

---

#### **CALL TO ORDER**

[Time: 00:00:01]

Mayor Lane: It's nice to have you here this evening to join us for this meeting. And I would like to call to order our September 13<sup>th</sup>, 2016 city council meeting. It's a regular meeting and we'll start with the roll call, please.

#### **ROLL CALL**

[Time: 00:00:14]

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Thank you, Your Honor. Mayor Jim Lane.

Mayor Lane: Present.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Vice Mayor Kathy Littlefield.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Councilmembers Suzanne Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Virginia Korte.

Councilmember Korte: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Linda Milhaven.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Guy Phillips.

Councilman Phillips: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: David Smith.

Councilman Smith: Present.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: Acting Acting City Manager, Brad Hartig.

Acting Acting City Manager Brad Hartig: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: City Attorney Bruce Washburn.

City Attorney Bruce Washburn: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: City Treasurer Jeff Nichols.

City Treasurer Jeff Nichols: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: City Auditor Sharron Walker.

City Auditor Sharron Walker: Here.

City Clerk Carolyn Jagger: And the Clerk is present.

Mayor Lane: A couple of times if you would like to speak, you would fill out one of these white cards that the city clerk is holding up over her head to the right here. And if you would like any comments, the yellow card is for that purpose, and we will look at it during course of proceedings this evening.

We have Tom Cleary and Jason Glenn. They are generally right there directly in front of me, if you have need of their assistance and the area behind the council dais are reserved for council and staff, but we do have facility, restroom facilities under that exit sign over there to my left.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

[Time: 00:01:25]

Mayor Lane: So this afternoon, this evening, I will say, we have mom scouts second and fourth graders, their leader, among others, I'm presuming, but Jordan Rose, if you could bring the gentlemen together, they will lead us in the pledge. If you can, please rise. Any time you are ready.

Mom Scouts: I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America, and to the republic for which it stands: One nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

Mayor Lane: All right, gentlemen, if you would like, you can turn that microphone around so you can face the audience and each individually, if you could line up -- line up, and then introduce yourself and maybe tell us where you go to school and what your favorite subject is.

Turner Ashby: My name is Turner Ashby. My favorite subject is P.E. and I go to Phoenix Country Day School.

Matthew: I'm Matthew, and my favorite subject is science.

Carson Rose: My name is Carson Rose and my favorite subject is P.E.

Brandon Shuster: My name is Brandon Shuster and my favorite subject is P.E.

Liam: My name is Liam and my favorite subject is math.

Garen Ready: Hello, my name is Garen Ready and my favorite subject is Spanish.

Bo Brigham: Hello, my name is Bo. Bo Brigham and my favorite subject is art.

Alex: Hello, my name is Alex, and my favorite subject is P.E.

George Suko: Hi, my name is George Suko and my favorite subject is P.E.

Blake Huskey: My name is Blake Husky and my favorite subject is recess.

David: Hi, my name is David, and my favorite subject is reading.

Logan: Hi, my name is Logan and my favorite subject is P.E.

Carter: Hi, my name is Carter and my favorite subject is music.

Linus: Hi, my name is -- wait. I forgot. Hi, my name is Linus and my favorite subject is P.E.

Dylan Grossman: Hello, my name is Dylan Grossman and my favorite subject is P.E.

Reed: Hi, my name is reed and my favorite subject is P.E.

Mayor Lane: Thank you very much, gentlemen. All right. If you would like, you can take a seat or -- thank you very much, Ms. Rose and parents all. Thank you

## **INVOCATION**

[Time: 00:05:13]

Mayor Lane: We're honored this evening to have pastor Freddy Wyatt of the First Southern Baptist Church of Scottsdale with the invocation.

Pastor Freddy Wyatt: Would you join me in prayer. Father we thank you for this great day and lord, every day is a gift. We recognize you today as the maker of it, and the giver of all good gifts in our life. Lord, as we have the children here tonight, saying the pledge, and introducing themselves, we pray for families here in Scottsdale. We pray for the children, God. We pray that you would protect the children and our families from violence here and thank you, God, for how you have protected our city. We pray your continual hand of protection on our city. Lord, we thank you for our council leaders, here, our city leaders and we pray that you would give us wisdom, establish the work of their hands and continue to bless their families, we pray. Father, thank you for this great city of Scottsdale, and we pray your many blessings upon us in every way. Lord, allow the meeting tonight to be conducted, lord, with wisdom, with prudence, with gentleness. And we just ask for your hand to be upon us, we pray in Jesus' name, amen.

## **MAYOR'S REPORT**

[Time: 00:06:39]

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Pastor. One item I would like to report is something that we were awarded from the Arizona Forward Foundation. This past Saturday, the city of Scottsdale and the Scottsdale Museum of the West received the prestigious Crescordia award from Arizona Forward. At their 2016 awards ceremony Scottsdale Museum of the West won the award for site development in the public sector category and located in the heart of Scottsdale. This adaptive reuse project demonstrates landscape architecture and exceptional capabilities to exceed the ordinary. It ignites our history with the present. Ecological with the sensory and creating a lasting mace of substance and integrity.

It's truly a beautiful land cape project, thanks in part to Caldwell shelter landscape architecture and today we have Gary Myer, with the city of Scottsdale Museum of the West here to accept at ward from the city. I might -- the award from the city. I might say if you haven't been to the Museum of the West, it's a must see. For a museum to have received a Smithsonian affiliation within one year of its existence, is outstanding and then just a few weeks ago to be named the best western art museum in the nation by "true west" magazine is another outstanding feature. Wonderful facility, but congratulations certainly to the city and to the museum.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

[Time: 00:08:39]

Mayor Lane: Okay. We are now into our public comment period and we have four cards requested to speak on the public comment and this is a period that's reserved for citizens comments regarding non-agendized items in which no official action will be taken, in fact, there is no community back and forth. It's a one-way presentation or statement as it may be. Speakers are limited to three minutes each and we do reserve up to 15 minutes for five speakers at this time, and there is time if there is needed at the end of the meeting for public comment as well. Right now we have four cards to speak. And we have three that are associated with one another, but we will start with Steve Ziomek.

Steve Ziomek: We are waiting for a slide to come up there. We go. Mr. Mayor and councilmembers, I'm here today as a 35-year Scottsdale resident, a veteran of the United States Coast Guard and the president of the Thunderbird field two veterans memorial, a 501(c)(3) nonprofit. My purpose today is to give you an update on the Thunderbird field veteran memorial project, a project we have been working on for almost two years now.

Next slide, please. As you know, Thunderbird field two was built primarily with Hollywood money in 1942. It was built for the sole purpose of training Army air corps pilots. 1500 men and women were trained. These brave young men and women trained in the Stearman biplane, a Boeing PT-17 cadet. After the war, the airport was deactivated and subsequently sold to the Arizona State teachers college, now A.S.U., then the Seventh-Day Adventists and in 1966 to city of Scottsdale.

Wrong way on the slides. There we go. The purpose of our nonprofit is to commemorate the rich history of the airport, honor the sacrifices of the 5500 Army air corps pilots and provide a true veterans memorial and gathering place for the city of Scottsdale. Our goal is to acquire a Stearman biplane, mount it in an atmosphere that showcases the history of the field and display the service plaques of the five armed services and the revered M.I.A. P.O.W. plaque. We started out a couple of years ago looking at the northeast corner of Scottsdale and Thunderbird. Right behind the one with the sculpture.

This corner would have been ideal, except for a couple of issues. One F.A.A. requirements and number two, current city infrastructure. When we enclosed the fabric airplane to weather the -- to protect it from the elements and weather and then provide school bus parking, it became an issue primarily with the F.A.A. We were too close to the runway. Thus after a period of time, the project died, until we found out from the airport director, Gary Mascaro told us about the redesign of the terminal and the business center. This is what we have now, the new airport business center and terminal area.

The challenge for us now is money and time. Our 501(c)(3) doesn't have the money available, and nor do we feel we can raise the amount of money in the time provided. We will be providing over \$100,000 to acquire the Stearman. We are looking at an additional \$400,000 to put it outside and

\$700,000 to put it inside. We don't have that money and we are asking the city council to agendaize it and speak about it and investigate it and see if it can be included in the already approved \$25 million capital investment program that's already been approved by this council. Thank you very much.

[Time: 00:13:08]

Mayor Lane: Thank you Mr. Ziomek. Tom Hudson -- Tony Hudson, I'm sorry.

Tony Hudson: Thank you, Mr. Mayor, Council. I'm here as a ten-year veteran of the United States Air Force, former captain, fighter pilot, Air Force academy grad, son of a retired brigadier general, and awarded two oak leaf clusters, a merit of the Thunderbird field, and two veterans memorial, 501(c)(3) and the C.I.O. and founder of G.I. Joe coffee copy.

Mayor Lane: If you could move the microphone closer to you.

Tony Hudson: I mention my affiliation with the military to highlight the importance for which it has been in my life and how it has guided me to be a leader in the community. If it were not for the constant reminder that my father, the bases I lived on, as well as the teachers who tirelessly took us on field trips to learn about the heroes of past wars, I would not have made the decision to be a part of our future and serve.

Would, that I would like to make aware that the exclusion of the veterans memorial at the new Scottsdale terminal, the place where 5500 World War II pilots trained and fought in the war and the primary reason for the development of the Scottsdale development would forfeit the opportunity to honor those pilots and veterans who were trained and taught to protect the U.S. and -- fought to protect the U.S. and its freedom.

It would serve as a multiuse event space that can be used to -- for Scottsdale airport events, veteran commemorations and corporate V.I.P. events, all of which can generate additional revenue to the city of Scottsdale and add prestigious event venues within the city limits. Throughout the stay, the veterans are being remembered and honored and there are several other veteran memorials most in smaller cities than Scottsdale.

Next slide, please. As you can see, there are several throughout, with Fountain Hills, Anthem, and Arizona, you have Payson, Prescott, Phoenix, inner Phoenix Tempe, and then the smaller memorial outside in civic center mall which serves the place for special honorary ceremonies this memorial does not show case the history of the Scottsdale airport and its place in the military history. It will be a place where Arizonans and tourists can view, visit, and see the actual air frame, which they trained in and connect with the past of those who were significant in the shaping of the future of Americans. Without the inclusion of this project into our construction project, our nonprofit would not be able to afford the construction of this memorial at its rightful place. Thank you for your time and consideration.

[Time: 00:16:22]

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Hudson. Mr. Bruce Weber.

Bruce Weber: I'm Bruce weber, a 25, 27 year resident of Scottsdale. I'm part of the Thunderbird Field, and I'm a captain who has flown hundreds of hours with the Scottsdale squadron and Homeland Security missions throughout Arizona. I say this not because of us, but many resident are not aware of the civil air patrol, in mar the youth program. We have a new Cessna 206 right here in Scottsdale and we rely on volunteers would pay their own way to provide those vital services as we encourage those young C.A.P. cadets to follow us.

One of our core missions with our memorial is to bring the excitement of flight and awareness to the civil air patrol to our youth as we regularly fly them around on orientation missions. Our veterans memorial will also be a place where we can gather, invite students and conduct memorials to bring awareness of not only the history of the airplane and the young pilots who train there but provide a brief education to our young men and women about the benefits and the years that lie ahead in serving our country and community. All of our branches will be represented with links to the many educational opportunities that are available to them.

Steve and Tony are both great examples of what an academy scholarship can provide today. Many of our leaders today got their start in the civil air patrol, and R.O.T.C. programs and certainly at the academy. So many of their folks don't know the full benefits that those programs provide, both on education and in character building. Needless to say, virtually everyone I know today who has volunteered to serve our country whether on active duty or in the reserves has come away with the pride of serving to protect our country and Preserve the constitution.

The new terminal building will also include a civil air patrol office and our display will include information about the C.A.P. Too many are still not aware of the Scottsdale squadron and the many opportunities. It simply is not top of mind.

As a volunteer opportunity in Scottsdale, our group today sees our mission as equally important to our youth which as I mentioned is to bring awareness to the outstanding benefits that serving our country can provide. The key is simply awareness, and our project will do that. Starting with our display of the Boeing cadet trainer in the foyer. It will not only be a focal point, but hopefully beg the question, mom and dad, what is that? Why is that here? We have a great opportunity to provide that awareness and the capital improvement program. I ask that you consider reviewing the capital improvement program with the thought of improving our project in that. Thank you very much.

[Time: 00:19:42]

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Weber. Next on the public comment is Matthew Selnor. Salenger.

Matthew Salenger: Hi. Mayor, councilmembers, my name is Matthew Salenger. I'm not sure if this is -- yep. Great. I'm an artist and architect based in Tempe, Arizona.

I worked earlier this year with the Scottsdale arts group to facilitate a work shop with teenagers throughout the valley to teach them about architecture. There's a lot of reasons why we feel this is valuable. There are a myriad of studies that show it has a huge range of health, both physical and mental health in our society as we have more happiness and lower crime as we have better design environments. It's one of my missions to make sure that we reach out to as many young people as we can to let them know about these facts and about how to understand aesthetics and how their world relates to it. And this is a great way that we can work with the Scottsdale arts to get this message out. And so we had a bunch of students sign up. We got together a bunch of architects.

We had the workshop at my home and studio, which you can see in these pictures. They came out. We actually designed something together, and then they produced the models themselves with the design, and created a lot of really neat, neat little buildings. And we wanted to let you know that there's going to be an exhibit. I think it's opening on October 14<sup>th</sup>. Of the students work in the Scottsdale center for the arts building and invite everyone to come out. If we can get more support for these kind of activities so that we can have extracurricular workshops for students and get them out of the normal kind of run of the mill education that they are doing at their schools and do something that's hands on and learning with aesthetics. Thank you very much.

#### **CONSENT AGENDA**

[Time: 00:21:54]

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Mr. Salenger. That completes our public comment at this time. So we will move on to our consent items.

Councilmember Korte: Mayor, I move to accept consent agenda items, 1 through 17.

Mayor Lane: Thank you for that. I was looking to see if we have any minutes. We have the consent agenda motion.

Councilwoman Klapp: Second.

Mayor Lane: I'm sorry, Vice Mayor?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: I would like to pull item number 12, please.

Mayor Lane: Okay. Item 12 is a request, the NCAA men's final four event, it's a request to adoption resolution 10532 authorizing funding, but not to exceed \$150,000 from the event development portion of the tourism development fund nor the NCAA men's final four event. So we will pull that and there is no other regular agenda item.

So we will pull that for right now and are there any other questions on the remaining consent items or can amend that request to move.



Councilmember Korte: So amended.

Councilwoman Klapp: Yes.

Mayor Lane: So it is now one through 17, absent item 12 and it's been seconded. By Councilwoman Klapp. I think we are then ready to vote. All of those in favor please register your vote. Aye. All of those items 1 through 17 absent 12 have been authorized. If you are here for any of those items and you care to stay with us, that's fine, otherwise you can leave quietly.

**ITEM 12 – NCAA MEN’S FINAL FOUR EVENT**

[Time: 00:24:09]

Mayor Lane: Move on to item 12, regular agenda, and if we could ask staff for a presentation, I'm presuming that's what the Vice Mayor would like.

Tourism and Events Director Karen Churchard: Hello, Mr. Mayor, we have Steve Geiogamah from our office and Stephanie Jarvis, a member of the final four host that will make a presentation.

Mayor Lane: All right thank you, Karen.

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: Good evening, Mayor and Councilmembers. The Phoenix final four local organizing committee has an agreement for a one-year agreement. It will be played on Saturday, April 1<sup>st</sup>, 2017, with the national finals on April 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2017. There are additional ancillary activities that will stay place throughout the weekend, besides just the games themselves. 80% of the games and attending will be out of state and represent the final four teams and corporate sponsors as well.

It's estimated that it draw 1500 national media members and regional impact of \$130 million. The \$130 million comes from an system provided by the NCAA regarding tournaments that have taken place at other locations. It also provided how they will partner with the city and the local organizing committee to leverage the tournament for the local tourism industry. When we take a look at, that we believe from the college championship games we were able to leverage, during that analysis, about 160 additional thousand dollars. A little different from the basketball tournament but nonetheless had to put that in perspective. There's a public purpose, and the marketing and promotional benefits provide direct consideration, substantially equal to the city's expenditure.

The requested action this evening, per resolution, 1532, authorizing the mayor, with the Phoenix final four local organizing committee, to authorize no more than \$150,000 in funding for the tourism development fund, from the tourism development fund from the NCAA men's final four and authorizing new Scottsdale convention and tourism and marketing program, related to the men's final four tournament.

[Time: 00:26:45]

Mayor Lane: Thank you. Is that completed? I've got a quick question. I'm not sure if councilwoman -- or the Vice Mayor, but what is the total that is being requested for this tournament from all valley cities?

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: In regards to that, I know Scottsdale is potentially investing up to \$150,000. To have that number put into perspective, I would like to have Stephanie Jarvis come up and give us an idea of what the regional request is.

Stephanie Jarvis: Thank you. I don't have the exact numbers memorized, I should but they get confused in my head but we have close to \$500,000 coming in from the city of Phoenix. The city of Tempe is above \$100,000 as well. Mesa has come in at under \$100,000, and the up to of Paradise Valley has committed \$50,000. And Glendale has committed approximately \$30,000 if I believe that's correct.

Mayor Lane: Okay. Thank you. Vice Mayor.

[Time: 00:27:45]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: My concern basically was we were committing \$150,000 more or less of our bed tax money to an event that's going on in Glendale, which, you know -- and they were mentioning well, that's going to bring bed taxes to Scottsdale because people will stay in our hotels. They will stay in our hotels anyway. My thought has always been that the bed tax money goes to support the events that are going on in Scottsdale, and why are we now moving away from that? I'm confused that we want to do that. You know, our funds are limited. We don't have that many that we can just send them off to everywhere and I think they should stay here and work with our own tourism events that can use additional funding.

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: Councilwoman Littlefield, I understand your question. Generally when we deal with events that are on this scale, that are regionally based, as we mentioned the funding that's taking place, we provided funding through the bed tax to support those type of activations whether they be Super Bowl or the college championship game, it's a perfect example of that. We also provided the competitor group, the P.F. Chang Rock and Roll Marathon that's regional based as well and funding support in the past.

Most of the activations and deliverables are through marketing, professional, advertising and even room nights. I believe we identified a thousand room nights and I think we gain room nights through the event itself. But we try to have the deliverables, and our dollars are being used through a regional event of this scale.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Well thank you very much. I do support tourism and I support the tourism events through the valley but I have a hard time justifying that much money going into the events being held in another city. Thank you.

[Time: 00:29:44]

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Vice Mayor. When we talk about these kinds of things, certainly the application of funds that are extracted, if you will, by most of the major sporting events, includes the Super Bowl and other events that we contribute to, the commitment that you have here with regard to 1,000 hotel and resort room nights, is there any stipulation as to whether or not if they are not -- do we keep some accounting for that -- that application?

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: That is correct. For all the deliverables identified, post event report, the relationship with the organizing committee will ensure that we will receive that. If not, then the contract requires that there are opportunities for us to decrease the funding or not provide the funding at all, related to the agreement.

Mayor Lane: So is this one of those after -- payments after the fact?

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: That is correct. When all the contract deliverables have been met.

Mayor Lane: Depending upon whether the performance comes up to what is indicated or --

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: That is correct.

Mayor Lane: Are there any NCAA events planned in Scottsdale?

Stephanie Jarvis: We're still working on that. The fan fest and the music festival will be -- they haven't been publicly announced yet but it's likely they will be in downtown Phoenix. The games will be in Glendale but there's a lot of sponsor parties. There are large parties. I know one group is looking at a very high-profile venue in old town Scottsdale for their biggest hospitality event for their corporate partners and champions. Just to note, the bulk of the sponsors and the corporate sponsors will be staying in the Scottsdale and the Paradise Valley area. So we expect a lot of events related to those groups.

Mayor Lane: Yeah, I think we could probably anticipate that they will, but there's no commitment, as far as some of those other additional events. We have had arrangements in the past with other sports franchises and sport tournaments, whether we've had something more specific.

I see where we have -- where we'll work with the Scottsdale's Convention and Visitors Bureau to encourage the use of Scottsdale venues. I'm not sure exactly how that might be encouraged. But at the same time, I -- I have always had a bit of concern on our participation in these, when it comes to how do we -- how do we weigh up and frequently we are measured by our participation by the number of hotel rooms we have, no matter where we might be in the valley. So I -- I appreciate how these things work. It would be nice to have some greater commitment to some of the events here, which is something we have worked on in the past. But -- okay.

Let's -- I think I have another request by Vice Mayor Littlefield.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Just one final question on this. I noticed at the end of the blog here, that you gave us on our agenda items that there are a lot of tickets that go on this thing, 60 FanFest tickets, and six tipoff party tickets and six Friday night concert tickets. Where are those tickets going? How are they going to be divided out.

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: We will use those tickets for public relations and business development opportunities. We had conversations at the Scottsdale convention visitors bureau, as well as the economic development department and how best to use those. We began those conversations a few months ago when we first started reaching out, and we reached to the city on how to use those and that's current plan for how we will use those.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you.

[Time: 00:33:31]

Mayor Lane: All right thank you Vice Mayor and Councilwoman, Korte.

Councilmember Korte: Thank you. Has the Tourism Development Commission reviewed this? And approved it?

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: They have. That is correct.

Councilmember Korte: And how does \$150,000 for this compare to some of the other sports events in the recent years?

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: Well, for example, the championship investment was a little over \$250,000. The Super Bowl was \$645,000, I believe.

Councilmember Korte: And I remember the Super Bowl event, we had specific -- mind fade here. We had a specific commitment for a number of rooms and access to different events connected with visiting C.E.O.s, et cetera, et cetera. What was it for the -- for last year's event for the 250? Were there specific commitments there?

Tourism and Events Manager Steve Geiogamah: There were commitments very similar to what we put together for the final four agreement. In fact our analysis -- our approach was very similar in how we evaluated the potential return on that. So it was very similar in how it was put together. I don't recall any tickets in that particular package to any games. There may have been some ancillary activities at this that time. You can confirm that, Stephanie. But most it was around marketing value and the hotels themselves with the hospitality package.

Councilmember Korte: Great. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Okay. That completes the questions. Think we are ready then to vote. We do need a motion. Yes.

Councilmember Korte: Mayor, I will move to approve item number -- well, approve the NCAA men's final four sponsorship resolution number 10532.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Second.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made and seconded. Seeing to further comments, we are ready now to vote. All those in favor please indicate by aye. The motion passes 6-1 with Vice Mayor Littlefield opposing. Thank you very much.

Stephanie Jarvis: Thank you very much, Mayor and Councilmembers.

Mayor Lane: All right. That takes care of our consent and the one item that was pulled, they have to further public comments. They have no further petitions.

#### **MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS**

[Time: 00:36:11]

Mayor Lane: And I guess at this point in time, I would ask if there are any mayor and council items. I believe that there may be.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Mayor, I would like to make a motion. I recently learned that -- that we put a survey on the city's website to get input from the community around the Desert Discovery Center, and I was pretty outraged to find out that that input was compromised and so I have a motion to make with several whereases, and whereas over 1,000 surveys commenting on the Desert Discovery Center were received over the evening hours of Saturday June 18<sup>th</sup> and the early morning hours of Sunday June 19<sup>th</sup>, every few seconds from a limited number of servers, that appeared to be a deliberate attempt to mask the source of these survey responses; and that out of the total of 1400 survey responses, 988 reported email addresses were discovered to not be valid emails. And as much as staff has not been able to conclusively substantiate the validity of these survey responses as surveys received from unique individuals.

Furthermore, it's important for the city to be able to use reliable technology to communicate with and to get information from the broadest representation of citizens and these anomalies question the integrity of the feedback received from the city's website and the valid opinions of citizens.

Our acting city manager has outlined a plan to address these concerns, and as a result, I would like to make a motion to agendaize, before the calendar year end for discussion and possible direction to staff an update to city council on the specific steps taken to ensure that input received through the city website is reliable feedback received from individual citizens.

Councilmember Korte: Second.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made and seconded. Councilman Phillips, would you like to speak towards this?

Councilmember Phillips: No, that was a mayor council item.

Mayor Lane: Yes, okay. Then we are ready then to vote. All those in favor, please indicate by aye. Those opposed with a nay. All right. The motion has been made and it's unanimous. Then we will have that agendized then as is indicated in the motion. Okay.

[Time: 00:38:52]

Mayor Lane: Now then Councilman, you disappeared but nevertheless, I know you want to speak. So in any case, Councilman Phillips.

Councilmember Phillips: Thank you, Mayor. In January of this year, this council approved a contract with the Desert Discovery Center Scottsdale, Inc. During the discussion I asked Christine Kovach if we approved the DDCS contract and after public outrage, if the citizens say they don't want the DDC in the Preserve, will the DDCS come back and say that the people have spoken and we will not pursue a DDC in the Preserve. Ms. Kovach said yes. I agreed to vote for the contract on this premise because I knew the public wouldn't want it.

During subsequent DDCS outrage, Sam Campana said publicly they would no longer take public comment unless it is positive feedback on the DDC and that their only mission was to plan the DDC and advocate for it. To me, this is violation number one.

Then the city of Scottsdale did their own online public survey which recently came out showing an overwhelming margin. And as Councilwoman Milhaven pointed out, although there's an anomaly to it and if it was 1400-80 and maybe 500 are bad. It's still 900-80. It is still way lopsided. These people are against the DDC in the Preserve.

Next a freedom of information act request has come to light showing not only a concerted effort by staff and the DDCS, but also some very members of this council to keep the public out of the process of putting the DDC in the Preserve. Also as early as 2013, these same members met with officers of the DDCS on how to get the RFQ who by the way, were the sole applicants. This is now public information. This is violation number two.

Next, the city charter states in Article 8, Section 8.11 that Preserved land over one acre cannot be lifted from Preserve designation without a public vote. This is not subject to a text amendment and council approval to change the meaning. By trying to do so, this becomes violation number three.

Finally from the FOIA request, it has also been found that an exorbitant amount of the contract is being wasted on lavish dinners, salaries and trips. At the rate of spending by the DDCS officers, they

will need to ask for more money before the year end.

In light of these revelations and more not mentioned, I move that we direct staff to agendize an item invoking the termination of convenience with the DDCS at our next scheduled regular council meeting.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Second.

Mayor Lane: The motion has been made and seconded. Seeing there's no further -- Would the second like to speak toward it?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Not exactly. There's just so many questions coming up that I think it needs to be reviewed and it needs to be discussed. Thank you.

[Time: 00:41:45]

Mayor Lane: Okay. Thank you. Well, I guess the one comment I would make is we are scheduled for the 19<sup>th</sup>, which is next Monday, to do exactly this, to discuss certainly the prospect of a public vote on this project, which I think is very important. I have been behind that effort for many months now. And I think that this proposal that was put forward by Howard Myers, back in May, is something that we accepted to review and by common consent, between Howard Myers and the Clerk's office, it was scheduled for the 19<sup>th</sup> of September which is next Monday. I think this is the forum which is intent on speaking about the idea of a public vote for it, but also I think the idea of whether or not whether it continues, whether it was voted upon, whether there are provisions to change the charter to vote on a charter amendment that would call for a public vote any time something like this were to come to the citizens.

I think we all recognize that the -- that the Preserve is a very, very, important asset for all of the citizens of the Scottsdale. I think it is very important that we do vote on these kinds of projects. It hasn't been determined exactly even though I think there's been certainly a preconceived conception of what is going to be provided at the end product, which is supposed to come within the year. But nevertheless, I think the 19<sup>th</sup> will probably uncover a lot of things about how this council feels as a whole, and maybe it gives us an opportunity to find out how the citizens feel as a whole as well.

So not withstanding some of the information or the thoughts or the -- or the thoughts that are out there simply as to what Scottsdale proposed or how it's being proposed this has been something that has been in the works for some time.

The last officially voted on the progress of it in 2008, which is nearly unanimous in its approval. But that's -- that's a different time, and frankly, the kind of thing that was outlined at that point in time, was different from what is actually being thought about at this point. So if you haven't seen that as of yet, there's a process that we normally go through and I think that this would not necessarily -- frankly, it's not going to be done before we have this meeting next Monday.

So I won't be voting for this motion, but it's not because it's not some real consideration for what is

being proposed here, it's a matter that we have already got in a work study and I think that's something we definitely should be discussing among our citizens and a work study and with the staff, as to how we might move forward or not with this project.

So with that -- oh, Councilman Phillips?

[Time: 00:44:41]

Councilmember Phillips: Thank you, Mayor. And that's all well and good, but on the 19<sup>th</sup>, we are going to be discussing whether or not to change the charter to allow public vote. I'm not asking for that tonight. What I'm asking for is to direct staff to agenda the item invoking the termination of convenience with the DDCS who I think are not in compliance with the contract.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Councilman. That's all well and good and I understand that there is a distinction between what you are suggesting and what we are talking about on the 19<sup>th</sup>. But I'm a firm believer that I think the citizens should have an opportunity to discuss the idea of whether or not there's a vote on it. So it may be that --

Councilmember Phillips: Definitely mayor, excuse me but we won't be talking about that on the 19<sup>th</sup>.

Mayor Lane: Sorry, I wasn't finished.

Councilmember Phillips: Please finish.

Mayor Lane: Well thank you. But simply, it is important that they vote on it. After that meeting, it may be determined something along the lines you are talking about and it can be scheduled -- it can be brought forward at that point in time. But I wouldn't preempt this meeting.

Councilmember Phillips: I'm sorry, Mayor, I am just making the point that we won't be able to discuss this on the 19<sup>th</sup>.

Mayor Lane: No, and you are absolutely right about that but there will be a different conclusion on the 19<sup>th</sup> that may impact a number of opinions. I'm sorry. I realize we are talking about agendizing an item we are now discussing the terms of it, Mr. Washburn, so I appreciate that and I apologize for that dialogue.

City Attorney Bruce Washburn: Thank you, Mayor.

Mayor Lane: So we do have a motion and a second on the table to agendize such a report or request as indicated. All of those in favor please indicate by aye and those opposed with a nay.

The motion fails 5-2, with vice mayor Littlefield and Councilman Phillips proponents. So that takes care of that agenda item.



Any other agenda items and the next is the boards, commissions and task force interviews and appointments. I will turn it over to the Vice Mayor.

[Time: 00:46:56]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you, Mayor. Before we begin, Kelli has a few reminders for us.

Management Assistant to the Mayor Kelli Kuester: Thank you, Vice Mayor Littlefield, good evening, Mayor Lane and Council. Just a friendly reminder, as we are voting, please make sure that your microphones are on and you speak clearly and slowly so we can properly count the votes. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you, Kelli. This afternoon, the city council will be appointing Scottsdale residents interested in serving on nine different citizen boards and commissions. I want to thank all of those individuals for their willingness to volunteer their time in service to our community. Your time is very much appreciated. Following each set of interviews, we will vote on those for that board or commission.

When I call your name, please come to the podium. We ask that you cover the following material. State your name, address and how long you have lived in Scottsdale. Why do you want to serve on this board or commission? How do your experiences, whether they are educational, professional, or volunteer, qualify you to serve on the commission? What do you think is the top issue facing your board or commission? Please limit your comments to three minutes or less. We have a timer on the screen to help you manage that time.

Following each nominee's response, I will ask the councilmembers if they have any questions.

### **AIRPORT ADVISORY COMMISSION**

[Time: 00:48:37]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: The first commission that we will be looking at is the Airport Advisory Commission. There are three openings. Ken Casey's term expires September 21<sup>st</sup>, 2016 and he's not eligible for reappointment. Michael Goode's term expired July 7<sup>th</sup> and he's not eligible for reappointment. William Shuckert's term expired July 9<sup>th</sup> and he's not eligible for reappointment.

There are three vacancies and six nominees. The nominees are John Berry, Larry Brown, Cory Little, Kevin Maxwell, Charles McDermott, and Renee Wittrock. We'll begin with John Berry, if you could come to the podium, please.

Airport Advisory Commission Applicant John Berry: Hello, Mayor, council people. My name is John Berry, I live at 12790 North 82<sup>nd</sup> place. I lived in Scottsdale for 26 years. My good friend and neighbor, Steve Ziomek encouraged me to apply. I'm a real estate commercial developer. We moved our headquarters to Council in 2000.

You may remember some cases I had here in front of the council, very close to the airport. Also I'm a private pilot. I got my private pilot license in 1979, when I was much younger at Scottsdale airpark. I have owned an F.B.O. I owned a chart company and I currently fly out of Scottsdale airport.

So I think I can bring the development side and the aviation side, experience, and be helpful to the commission. So I would love to everybody if you will have me. Any questions?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Any questions from the council? Thank you very much, Mr. Berry.

Airport Advisory Commission Applicant John Berry: Thank you.

[Time: 00:50:46]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Next is Larry Brow.

Airport Advisory Commission Applicant Larry Brow: Good afternoon, and thank you Mayor and Councilmembers. My name is Larry Brow and I'm the owner and the operator of Leading Edge Real Estate and beyond that, I'm a pilot and aviation enthusiast. I moved to Scottsdale about four years ago, and I'm now a permanent resident and live at 9990 Scottsdale Road and I'm interested in becoming a member of the aviation airport committee or commission rather.

I have been a pilot for many, many years. I have 14,000 hours in multiple ratings and used to be a fixed base operator in a small community in New Mexico. And I did all the normal services that an F.B.O. offers. During that same period of time, I was asked to join as a member of our board of our small community hospital, it's a 56-bed mace with 250 employees and during that time period, I became the chairman of the board of that enterprise. I have numerous experiences with aviation community. I developed a -- an airport managers association in the state of New Mexico, and I'm interested in seeing the awesome expansion and improvement that you are doing at the Scottsdale airport. You must be commended for your aviation interest and support and you have a facility out there you can be very proud of. Any questions?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Any questions? Seeing none thank you very much. Cory Little.

[Time: 00:53:14]

Airport Advisory Commission Applicant Cory Little: Hi, my name is Cory Little and I feel compelled to tell everyone that my favorite subject in school is math. I currently live at 27728 North 68<sup>th</sup> Place in Scottsdale.

I'm here today to ask for your support and vote to appointment to the Airport Advisory Commission. As a 14-year resident of Scottsdale, I have been fortunate to witness the tremendous growth of the Scottsdale airpark and its positive impact on our community. I have always enjoyed being a part of the Scottsdale community and I want to contribute to its betterment for my family, city residents and businesses. I'm a family man, a businessman, an aviator and I live, work and play within a few miles

of the Scottsdale airfield. I spend almost all of my career for 22 years in the aerospace industry. I'm a current and future development in of the Scottsdale airport and airpark and the impact on the surrounding communities. I'm a graduate of Arizona State University. I have a master's of science in aerospace engineering in 1994. I'm currently employed at Honeywell aerospace based here in Arizona. And my career in aviation includes engineering, power plant immigration, business management, customer support, technical sales and global after-mark sales. I have also worked for a small aviation start-up and for a fixed space operator at the Scottsdale airport.

My perspective on the business and the general aviation market. Along with my leadership and communication skills will be a Bennett in helps to objectively address the current issues to help chart a positive course for the development of the airport, airpark and surrounding communities. We can only augment the ability to understand the relationship between government and community.

I'm an active member in the Arizona aviation -- the Arizona Business Aviation Association, and I'm also involved in the Thunderbirds Two Veterans Memorial. I'm fortunate to have had the experience I had in aviation from the perspectives of a small business, and a large corporation, whether the proposed changes to the flight path from Scottsdale aerospace and the leasing and the licensing of commercials and businesses and the terminal nearby are critically important to maintain the balance between the safety and the vitality of the airpark and the surrounding communities. Finally, I'm very fortunate to have met many people in the aviation community in Scottsdale and I would like to point out that I have been endorsed by two key people, number one Steve Ziomek and also Richard Shuler, one of the founders of Arizona business aviation association.

It's my passion for aviation and extensive aviation background and to further my community service which makes me the best and logical choice to work with all members of city council and mayor to help ensure that the strategic decisions are made accurate, factual and timely data. Thank you very much. Thank you for your support.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you. Are there any questions? Thank you so much. Next we have Kevin Maxwell.

[Time: 00:56:34]

Airport Advisory Commission Applicant Kevin Maxwell: Thank you Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Littlefield and members of Council. My name is Kevin Maxwell. I live on east Cambridge. I have lived in my current home for a year and a half. And I lived in Scottsdale for 12 years.

We talk about points of pride and we mention the Preserve, the Museum of the West and WestWorld and they are great assets to our community. I believe we have a great general aviation and a great airport in our backyard. I believe sometimes overlooked for the benefit that it gives us. I don't need to tell members of the council what an important driver of the economy our airport and the county airpark is to our city. It's a gateway to our wonderful tourism economy.

Why do I want to serve? To begin like everyone here, I'm committed and passionate about the

future wellbeing of our city. The city is about to spend \$25 million on improvements to the airport. Future members of the airport advisory council will be protectors of this investment. I am ensuring that. Capital improvements yields all about the community.

I'm a small business technology consultant. Before that I worked for Alaska Airlines in flight operations. I worked at Sky West Airlines and ramp operations and later serving in management. I worked with an F.B.O. at Sky Harbor. This experience has led me to a general aviation knowledge of the F.A.R.s and part 139 and 145. I'm not a pilot. I never flown a 128 in I.F.R. conditions in class b air space and I never shot the arrival in a citation. I'm an aviation enthusiast. If you come to my home, you see various aviation memorabilia. You see me point out various aircraft which drives my wife crazy. And if you see me on the Internet, you see I once did the talk about the history of airport codes. What I am, is an airplane nerd.

I told you what I'm not. A I'm a graduate of Scottsdale's leadership of 2009. For that I serve on the board of directors of a local pet rescue. The Airport Advisory Commission to enhance the mission and the legacy of the organizations I serve. I do not work for the airport or have a vested interest in the operations of the airport. What I do offer is a different perspective, strong leadership background and critical thinking skills. I'm an entrepreneur, an info elevator and consensus builder. If given the opportunity to serve, I will look after all interests of airport as it relates to the airport operations both on the tarmac and the surrounding community.

I know you are all busy so I don't know if you had a chance to check your email. Members of the council were sent from outgoing airport advisory Will Shuckert. He spoke about my attendance at the airport advisory committees in the past and airport issues and he offered his support. I would like to thank Mr. Shuckert for his service on the board and all the board and commission members. You have a difficult decision for us tonight. I'm sure you will make the best decision. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Do you have any questions for this gentleman? Thank you very much. Next we have Charles McDermott.

[Time: 00:59:55]

Airport Advisory Commission Applicant Charles McDermott: Good afternoon and thank you for the opportunity to present my qualifications for consideration for appointment to the Airport Advisory Commission. My name is Charlie McDermott and I reside at 19700 north 76<sup>th</sup> street and I have lived in Scottsdale for almost five years.

I have spent the last 32 years of my professional career helping airport sponsors across country develop their airport. I'm a senior airport planner and project manager for, excuse me, a local aviation consulting firm, where I'm responsible for preparing airport master plans, environmental assessments and other aviation-related studies for airports in the state of Arizona. I have managed several planning projects with commercial service and general aviation airport in the state of Arizona. So I feel I have an understanding of the unique challenges that the Arizona airports are confronted with.

I would like to serve on the Airport Advisory Commission because I believe it's important to give back to the community that you live in. And also because I love aviation. Serving on the commission would allow me the opportunity to use my aviation experience that I have gained from working at over 95 different airports across the country. For example, I know that the airport recently completed an airport master plan in 2015, which is an excellent document and will help to guide the airport into the future. I believe that I can help to facilitate and interpret the recommendations contained in your master plan, based on my extensive knowledge of airport planning process, as well as provide guidance for implementing future proposed projects. I also serve on the board of directors for the airport -- for the Arizona airports association which is a statewide organization that helps to foster and grow aviation -- the aviation industry in state of Arizona.

There are important issues facing the Scottsdale airport, but they are not unlike many of the issues that are facing airports across the country. Some of the important issues are noise, revenue, growth, and retapping existing businesses and tenants on the airport. With regard to noise. Nearly every airport that I have worked at has noise complaints. What I have learned from my experience is airports would work with their communities rather than against their communities have much -- have more success in being a good neighbor. As a commissioner, I would be open and understanding when listening to the community regarding their noise and other related aviation concerns.

Second, looking for ways to increase revenue is always important for the success of any airport and finally retaining existing tenants and businesses is critical for any airport to remain financially sustainable. Airports are a business and they need to grow to survive, in an ever increasingly competitive aviation industry. I feel I have a solid understanding of the tenants and business needs, and especially when it comes to those located on the airport. Again thank you for your time, and thank you councilman Smith and Vice Mayor Littlefield for nominating me.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Are there any questions for this gentlemen? Thank you very much. Next we have Renee Wittrock.

[Time: 01:03:35]

Airport Advisory Commission Applicant Renee Wittrock: Can you hear me okay? Yeah. Okay. Thanks. Hi, mayor, council people, Vice Mayor thanks for having me. I'm Renee Wittrock. I know most of you. I live at 14011 North 83<sup>rd</sup> Street in the airpark. I live on the kind of Hayden and Thunderbird. I also work on the corner of Evans and north site and I have for the last four years that I have lived here in Scottsdale.

I love Scottsdale. I love the airport. I love the economic development side of it. I handle as a C.F.O. for 30 years for Wittrock Financial, I handle hundreds of millions of dollars for people all across the country and businesses. So I'm used to dealing in big numbers and you know we have those big numbers coming down the pipe.

On the commission, as far as why I really want to do this, I'm the incoming chair for the airpark

committee for the Scottsdale chamber of commerce and I would like to be a voice for not only the citizens that live in the airpark, but also for the businesses here and the businesses that the chamber represents. I don't have my glasses on.

Oh. Qualifications. Okay. I'm on every single board everywhere. And I have sat on every focus initiative group for the last four years. We didn't have them this year but we have kind of a side council I would call it on looking at all the survey results for the chamber. I'm all about making Scottsdale an amazing place to live as it is now, and growing into the future.

I can't see. Oh, yeah the biggest issue. I talked to Gary and the biggest issue is noise complaints and I live there, and I just have a different perception about it. I love watching the jets and the planes come in, much like when I lived on the lake in Iowa, some of the boats that went by were really noisy. And some of them were super quiet and some of them were close to my dock and some were far away but I got to enjoy all of them. So now I don't have water but I have amazing blue skies that I can look at and all of my neighbors can look at and we get to see this magnificent come in and out and to me, every single time the plane lands that just advantages Scottsdale. I hope that's enough and if you have any questions, please let me know.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Any questions? Thank you very much.

[Time: 01:06:20]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Each council member can vote for three nominees and we'll start the voting with Councilman Smith, and please speak up and clearly so I can hear you down here at the end. Thank you.

Councilman Smith: Thank you, Vice Mayor. I will vote for John Berry, Cory Little and Kevin Maxwell.

Councilmember Korte: John Berry, Kevin Maxwell and Renee Wittrock.

Mayor Lane: Cory Little, Kevin Maxwell and Renee Wittrock.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Councilwoman Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: John Berry, Kevin Maxwell and Charles McDermott.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Cory Little, Kevin Maxwell, and Renee Wittrock.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: I will vote for Larry Brow, Cory Little, and Charles McDermott. Councilman Phillips.

Councilmember Phillips: Mr. Little, McDermott and Brow.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Okay. It looks like we have Cory Little, Kevin Maxwell, and a tie. We vote

again between Mr. Berry and Renee Wittrock. We will begin again with Councilman Smith. Oh, McDermott also, thank you. There's three people to vote for. One vote a piece.

Councilman Smith: Thank you, Vice Mayor. John Berry.

Councilmember Korte: Renee Wittrock.

Mayor Lane: John Berry.

Councilwoman Klapp: John Berry.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Renee Wittrock.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: John Berry.

Councilmember Phillips: McDermott.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Okay. It's John Berry. There we go. Thank you very much. John Berry, Cory Little and Kevin Maxwell have been appointed.

#### **BUILDING ADVISORY BOARD OF APPEALS**

[Time: 01:08:47]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: The next board we have is the Building Advisory Board of Appeals. There are four openings. The Building Advisory Board of Appeals has the jurisdiction to recommend that minor variances in the electrical, plumbing and mechanical application of the building code be granted, and that alternative construction methods for materials be granted. There are no special qualifications by city code, however, members appointed to the Building Advisory Board of Appeals should be qualified by building and training to decide on matters pertaining to the billing.

Mike Bergeldt's expired. And Bill Swekert's. And David Valencia's term expired December 8<sup>th</sup> of 2015, and he did not submit an application for reappointment. There are four vacancies and there's one nominee. And the nominee is Scott Rothman. Mr. Rothman, if you would like to come up to the podium. Thank you.

Building Advisory Board of Appeals Applicant Scott Rothman: My name is Scott Rothman, and I have been a resident of Scottsdale for approximately 14 years. Judging by the Dearth this application, you may wonder why I'm interested.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Could you speak closer to the microphone?

Building Advisory Board of Appeals Applicant Scott Rothman: Yes. I took an opportunity to sit in on this board's meetings and I found the individuals, the citizens of Scottsdale that participated to be very

knowledgeable and the advisor from the city, Mr. Michael Clack, the director of development services did an excellent job. Now, I moved here approximately 14 years ago from south Florida. I took the position with Scottsdale insurance company, a name that's familiar with some of the members of the committee and the commission. And I started my career there as the national catastrophe coordinator, catastrophe being the catastrophic weather event somewhere in the country that results in a large number of exposures. My entire career has revolved around property claimed in the insurance industry and I retired from Scottsdale now known as nationwide, as the senior property claims specialist in the office. So I do have a bit of a background in construction, buildings, code issues, and I thought aside from learning from some of the present members on this particular board, that I might be able to participate and be of some benefit to the board as occasion might arise.

I don't have much else to say. I think I answered all the questions and -- and the question number four, about issues facing this board, I'm not sure that's, you know, really relevant, unless someone has an emergency code request for a change or modification. Any questions?

[Time: 01:12:33]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Any questions? Thank you very much. Each councilmember can vote once. We will begin with Councilmember Korte.

Councilmember Korte: And I will vote for Scott Rothman.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Mayor?

Mayor Lane: I too will vote for Scott Rothman.

Councilwoman Klapp: Scott Rothman.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Scott Rothman.

Councilmember Phillips: Rothman.

Councilman Smith: After due consideration, I too will vote for Scott Rothman.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: It is unanimous, Scott Rothman has been nominated and appointed. Thank you very much.

## **HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION**

[Time: 01:13:12]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Our next board is the Human Relations Commission. There are two openings. The Human Relations Commission advocates and promotes all dimensions of diversity and the commission acts an advisory body to the mayor, the city council and staff to make



recommendations on ways to encourage mutual respect and understanding among people.

Laurie Coe's term expired September 10<sup>th</sup> and she is eligible for reappointment and has submitted an application for consideration. Andrew song's term expired September 10<sup>th</sup> also and he's eligible for reappointment, however he's not submitted an application.

There are two vacancies and there are five nominees. The nominees are Laurie Coe, Susan Mellinger, Nadia Mustafa, Stuart Rhoden and Janice Shimokubo. We'll begin with Laurie Coe.

Human Relations Commission Applicant Laurie Coe: Good evening, Mayor and Councilmembers. My name is Laurie Coe and I live at 9214 East Wood Drive, Scottsdale Arizona. I have lived in Scottsdale for over 15 years but I lived in the valley for 38 years living in various little towns in the east valley.

I'm running for a second term. No man is an island, entire of itself. Every man is a piece of the continent, a part of the main. This is only a few lines of the poem by John Dunn. In its entirety, it's precisely how I view my lone place in the world. I'm a part of a family, a neighborhood, a city and beyond. I view myself as a citizen and having had the privilege and opportunity to serve on the Human Relations Commission for the last three years has been a wonderful and meaningful experience. Anyone would has ever been a teacher, a parent, or marginalized member of a minority understands this question. Why can't we all just get along? Everyone wants to have the experience of belonging and being respected.

The commission in last three years has accomplished a lot. We have had our civil dialogue series. We have partnered with the library, the center for the arts and SMOCA, bringing awareness to the community of our diversity as well as our unity. There's a lot of work still to be done and I hope you will vote for me and allow me to continue to serve on this commission.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Are there any questions? Thank you, Laurie. Next, we have Susan Mellinger. And I apologize if I mispronounce names.

[Time: 01:14:12]

Human Relations Commission Applicant Susan Mellinger: All right. I got it. Okay. My name is Susan Mellinger and thank you very much for giving me this opportunity to come before you and tell you a little bit about myself and perhaps what I can bring to this Human Relations Commission. As a psychotherapist, I think I have a really good understanding of what happens with people and the psychology of the human spirit. That doesn't always mean that I know exactly what motivates people, but it does mean that I have an understanding and I bring that to -- I think whenever you are working on a -- in a commission with people that you really have to have the ability to understand diversity yourself and how diverse you are internally. I think as an H.R. director, which I have been for a number of years, I worked on a lot of taxes and as H.R. director when you work on teams, you have to get people's buy-ins because a lot of times the companies are in situations where they really want the staff to do something and the staff doesn't like it very well. I learned to be pretty

persuasive about why we have this agenda and why we have to get on board. I thought about this.

You are talking about what faces this commission. I think one of the things that is a hidden agenda is the older person, much like ourselves, who really don't buy into ethnic diversity. They like to be in homogenous places because it's convenient, because it feels better, but as they get into a community where there is diversity, oftentimes at the find out that it doesn't feel very good and they are not educated on how to respond and there's a discomfort level with them. On this commission, I would hope that I would be able to say, how do we reach people of my age, your age, most of our ages around here to really change that paradigm so that they don't back away from diversity, but they embrace it? And one of the ways to do that is all of these things that the commission does and all of these events that the commission does, are we inviting people who are holder, do they even know about? Because when you are looking at millennials, a lot of those people, the millennials, they are very accepting.

Ask anyone would teaches college and they will tell you, you know, what my students are very accepting of anybody in the LGBT community. It's use, a lot of times, who are not. So that would be something that I think the commission, perhaps would need to be foe about.

I thank you very much for your time. Even I hope you vote for me. I'm really kind of fun sometimes.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Any questions? Next we have Nadia Mustafa.

[Time: 01:19:31]

Human Relations Commission Applicant Nadia Mustafa: Hi. My name is Nadia Mustafa and I live at 2634 North 89<sup>th</sup> Street. I lived in Scottsdale for nine years.

I want to serve on this commission because diversity and culture have always been a passion of mine. I think those are very important elements in the city of Scottsdale's continuing evolution and I would be ton honored to be a part of -- honored to be a part of fostering unity and understanding at this local level.

My qualifications, I -- for the -- before I had kids, I was an active journalist, and for many years, I lived in New York City, and was a senior reporter for "TIME" Magazine. In that capacity, I had a lot of broad exposure to different aspects of society, as well as garnering communication skills which come in handy in this sort of work. In addition, I am a board member of the American civil liberties union of Arizona which does exactly this type of work. So I'm already very familiar with these issues and how to go about them.

Also just from a personal standpoint, I grew up in the Midwest, the daughter of immigrants. So dealt with diversity challenges there and then I had a career and life in the big city and now nine years ago settled here in far north Scottsdale where I am a minority as a brown person. So still, you know, facing issues like that. Oh, and I went through Scottsdale 101 classes this past spring. So I have

learned a lot about the way the city works.

The things that the commission faces, although we have a rich and diverse heritage in Scottsdale, there are still a lot of pockets of homogenous populations. So we need to find a way to sort of permeate those invisible borders. Some of the ways we could do that are more social media and marketing with online tools, events that are attended maybe not just by people in certain vicinity or in a certain group, trying to really garner the entire population of the city across different cultures. Partners in collaboration with different Scottsdale organizations, just a few of my ideas. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Are there any questions? Thank you very much. Next we have Stuart Rhoden.

[Time: 01:22:30]

Human Relations Commission Applicant Stuart Rhoden: Good evening, Mr. Mayor and Council. My name is Stuart Rhoden and I met some of you last week at a town hall at LD23, and it's good to see you again.

I want to serve on the Human Relations Commission because I'm committed to expanding a deeper understanding of diversity and searchable justice issues throughout the city. I have over 20 years of experience working towards improvement in every community that I have lived in, like some in this room, I'm originally from Chicago. And I have gone to college in Philadelphia. I have taught in Los Angeles. And now I'm here working as a professor at A.S.U.

I have been an advocate for children and families. I have been a high school service learning coordinator at a private school in Chicago. I have served as a high school AP U.S. government in south central L.A. and now I served as a college professor, first at temple university -- my mind just went blank. Temple University, at Cabrini College and now at A.S.U. All my professional goals have been focused on building community relations and building bridges between different communities and diverse communities. My experiences prior to education, I worked on Capitol Hill, and in Springfield, Illinois on women and children's issues, which provided me a background and an overall understanding to learn not just about urban issues in Chicago, but the issues throughout the state of Illinois. I also volunteered with habitat for humanity and summer youth program, going down south to build houses in partnership with communities and people in need. And I have also worked as -- on a board member, in two different organizations when I was in Chicago, one of them working with homeless people and how to better feed them. Teaching about diversity and social justice is what I do. I'm building on teacher success and retain them so they can persevere them through their four years.

The top issue that faces the commission, as other people mentioned, there are a couple of things. The puzzle pieces are all in place in the city. It's just a matter of the putting those pieces to go. And one of the things that I think is the best way to do that is through an event that I worked on in Chicago called the Chicago dinners, which of course we would change the name and I would say, mind the gap. So the idea of creating committees to have dinner to break bread and discuss the issues that don't

plague us but concern us. Issues that sort of sit in the underbelly of what's going on.

Sort of -- so in conclusion, sort of what Laurie said, I am a teacher. I am a parent and I'm obviously a member of a minority group. So I have all three of those areas covered and I look forward to working with the commission and the city council in the future. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Are there any questions? Are there any questions from the council? Thank you. Next we have Janice Shimokubo.

[Time: 01:26:02]

Human Relations Commission Applicant Janice Shimokubo: Good evening, I'm Janice Shimokubo. We said we want to go back. This is where we want to live. So in 2012, we purchased our home way up in north Scottsdale and I officially moved here in December of last year.

I want to serve on this commission because as a woman of color, the issues of diversity and inclusion are near and dear to my heart and obviously a passion. I'm a third generation Japanese-American, born and raised in Chicago, but have been a minority in many instances and I feel that I understand the issues and can bring a lot to this commission. My experiences from a professional and a volunteer point of view can help me serve on this commission as well. Professionally, I worked for three Fortune 500 companies and I served on diversity committees in those corporations. From a volunteer standpoint, I served on the board of directors for the YWCA and the Asian-American institute based in Chicago. Between 1998 and 2001, I served as a commissioner on the Colorado civil rights commission. I think all of these experiences really provide me the opportunity to see things differently and more broadly and to really understand the importance of inclusiveness.

What do I think is the top issue facing this commission? Well, I have read the meeting minutes, I have viewed some the commission videos and what struck me is it's a good problem. I don't have the answer today, but the demand and the importance of this commission, I mean, I just -- I see these different groups coming to the commission, asking for acknowledgment, for support, be that monetary or be it the commissioners going to these events. I know many of these commissioners, it sounds like they are going to, many, many, events every month and I think that's phenomenal. I don't know the answer yet but I would do more of a corporate view to look at what's been done in the past, and what has been successful and what are the goals of city of Scottsdale in what are the priorities of the city and how can they work together with the community and the city to make sure that we can meet all of those needs? So I appreciate the opportunity to be a candidate and I would be honored to serve on this commission. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you. Are there any questions? Very good. Thank you very much.

[Time: 01:28:46]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: For this commission, each councilmember can vote for two nominees, and Mayor Lane, if you would begin, please.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Vice Mayor. I would vote for Laurie Coe and Janice Shimokubo.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Councilwoman Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Laurie Coe and Nadia Mustafa.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Laurie Coe and Nadia Mustafa.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: I will vote for Laurie Coe and Janice Shimokubo. Councilman Phillips.

Councilmember Phillips: I think this is hard. I think everybody is good.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Yes.

Councilmember Phillips: We want to continue with Laurie Coe and then -- geez, it's a tough decision. I will say Stuart Rhoden.

Councilman Smith: Laurie Coe and Susan Mellinger.

Councilmember Korte: Really tough. Quality, quality, applicants. Thank you very much. Laurie Coe and Nadia Mustafa.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: I think Laurie Coe and Nadia Mustafa. Oh, we have to vote again. It has to be four votes. Okay, Laurie Coe has been nominated -- or has been appointed. So now we have to vote again for the remaining candidate. And start with Mayor Lane again. This is the same commission.

Mayor Lane: I will vote for Stuart Rhoden.

Councilwoman Klapp: Nadia Mustafa.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Nadia Mustafa.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: This is a tough one. Nadia Mustafa.

Councilmember Phillips: Stuart Rhoden.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: I'm sorry, Mr. --

Councilman Smith: Susan Mellinger.

Councilmember Korte: And Nadia Mustafa.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Nadia Mustafa is appointed. Thank you very much. And this was one of

the more difficult appointments going. I want them all!

**HUMAN SERVICES COMMISSION**

[Time: 01:31:35]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Next we have the Human Services Commission. We have one opening. The Human Services Commission provides advisory recommendations to staff and to the city council on human services priorities and programs. Edid Seiden's term expired. So there is one vacancy available and there are five nominees. We'll start with Mark Culbertson.

Human Services Commission Applicant Mark Culbertson: Mayor, Vice Mayor, Councilmembers, I'm Mark Culbertson, I live on East Palm Ridge Drive. I have been a resident of Scottsdale for seven years. If it counts, my wife was raised here. So if we could add her numbers in there somewhere, that would be great.

I was looking for a way to get involved in giving back to my community. We love living in Scottsdale and raising a family here. I read in the paper about the boards and commissions and applied. One of the areas that attracted me was this committee, the human services committee where I have thought it was a great opportunity to not only give back to the community, but also to utilize my experiences and my talents, passion of trying to help people live better lives in the best way.

So my experiences, I'm currently an elementary school principal. Before that I was a teacher and before that I was a senior pastor and before that I was a youth pastor working with middle and high school students and all of those experiences I have been involved in helping get people involved in service and volunteer organizations. Besides that, I have years of experiences of being involved in a variety of different organizations as a volunteer in different roles. And so as looking at being a part of this I think bringing my experiences in not only being involved in volunteer opportunities myself, and different organizations, but being active in trying to get other people involved in volunteering in those roles. I think that would be a valuable asset to this committee. Also, my skills -- I think my strengths in all of my professional experiences is being able to organize a team and really help a team get to consensus. I think it would be a valuable asset to this commission.

The priority, I think for this I think there's a lot, but obviously the main one is prioritizing the needs of many worthy organizations, and trying to determine what funds are allocated to those when there's such a need of many different organizations. And so I think, again, bringing my team building skills and getting to know the different organizations and what their needs are, what their roles are, what their focus is, I think it would be valuable in helping to prioritize those needs and determining what funds are allocated.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you very much. Anyone have questions? Thank you. We'll move on. Jayne Hubbard?

[Time: 01:34:59]

Human Services Commission Applicant Jayne Hubbard: Good evening Mayor and Councilmembers. My name is Jayne Hubbard, and I have lived in Scottsdale for seven years, three years up in Grayhawk and four years just up the canal here. And I live at 7317 East Thornwood Drive.

I was attracted to this position, I think, because I have had a chance to interface a little bit with some people on this commission and it's been my lifetime work and I believe that as elected officials, volunteers, staff people, we live in covenant with the residents of the people that we serve, and part of that covenant is the services we provide and how we provide for them, how we guide them, how we choose them. As someone else said how we fund them and that's why I really wanted to be on this commission. I feel I have a lot of experience working in this area, I have degrees in -- as a pastor, part-time pastor. So a master of divinity up in far north Scottsdale and I have a degree in marriage and family therapy, have had practices, a counselor but currently I never would have believed I would become passionate about transportation. And that is how I interfaced most with the city of Scottsdale.

I would, in conjunction with a nonprofit who works with seniors and persons with disabilities and I work in collaboration with MAG. And so I have been a part of some of the Scottsdale initiatives and met wonderful Madeline and gotten our organization with the voucher program, but more than that, I see the experience I have writing grants, evaluating grants and writing programs, I have been a teacher, a family therapist, a social worker, a recreation director, a pastor, and now passion for transportation. And every single piece of that is all about evaluation, making the best choices for the resources we have, and in the issue that is most passionate to me, is because I moved by choice into old town, from Grayhawk, I came here knowing what was afoot, all the great things changing in the city, and I wanted to be a part of it. It's what attracted me, but I also moved into a neighborhood in a little older development, sort of the shadow of safari and sage and other places say, my goodness, my neighborhood is changing. Excited about it on the one hand and in other ways trying to figure out what it means to be a neighborhood now as some of the agencies, the stores, the things are changing around them. Our neighborhood will deal with it just fine. But I think there's some other neighborhoods that will have more challenges for how they meet the needs of the services that they need, as their neighborhoods grow. And we need to keep them healthy and vibrant.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you very much.

Human Services Commission Applicant Jayne Hubbard: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Anyone have questions? We will move on. Next Robert Jones.

[Time: 01:38:25]

Human Services Commission Applicant Robert Jones: Thank you, council, for allowing me this opportunity. I also want to thank Kelli, during this process of getting acquainted; you have excellent response from her for my questions, the procedures and the help with the application. And I also looked at the open meeting law about 45 pages and wondered whether it was worth being here. I

want to thank Kelly especially.

My name is Robert Jones. I live on East Harbour Street. I have been in Phoenix for 41. My involvement with Scottsdale was while I was in Phoenix, I became a member of the Scottsdale Rodeo club. So I know a little bit about Scottsdale.

I want to serve on the commission to assist organizations to succeed in their goals and expectations. On reading the minutes of commission's meetings and what the commission is accomplishing is directly related to my desire to assist these organizations in succeeding with their goals.

My experience includes working both sides of charities, from raising funds for distribution, assisting in writing grant applications, determining the validity and the qualifications of requests for funds, direct involvement in the operation of a major foundation. My profession as a C.P.A. required the ability to recognize problems and assist in solving those problems. Also, the recognition of adequate and inadequate accounting of a charity and to work all levels with the talent they have. My knowledge about the operations of the commission arise from reading the minutes and the website which suggests to me that funding is a priority issue. My approach to address that issue would be to determine what methods are being used for funding and attempt to find other sources or to increase funding from the current sources. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you very much. Anyone have questions? Next we have Greg Pierce.

[Time: 01:40:52]

Human Services Commission Applicant Greg Pierce: Thank you Mr. Mayor and council, thank you for this opportunity. My name is Greg Pierce I live at 20890 East 90 Place, Scottsdale up in the D.C. Ranch area.

The reason why I would like to serve on this commission, I'm from Minnesota. I came down here for a real estate conference in 2005 and, of course, I spent six days at the desert ridge D.W. Marriott. I was sold. So it took me about four years but as I have a passion for the seniors and helping seniors out because, you know, it's a tough world out there for them, not only for their care, but also for their housing too, and the reason that we run in and we are big on the -- I'm a big advocate and I partner with my partner too, she has a business working with seniors, is that believe it or not, not everybody in Scottsdale has a lot of money. And when it comes down to the time where they just can't live safely at home, there's a place that they have to go, and the low-income housing is a big issue and some of the biggest challenges that we run into is there is no money. So we are a big advocate. I tried to work with them to try to help them find money, and one is working with the V.A., and helping with different programs for their needs too.

So there's not only -- I know this commission serves a lot more feeds than just the seniors but I have a passion for that, because, you know, a lot of this falls upon them, due to a fall or something happening and with memory problems today, it's just running wild. So this is the reason I would like to serve on this commission to see if I can put my input into it.



I was a licensed steam fitter and pipe fitter in Minnesota for about 28 years. I did a lot of volunteer with the heat on program. I know you probably don't realize that here, but back there in Minnesota, it gets pretty cold. And not everybody has the money, you know, to keep their furnaces and things going. So we volunteered every year, our union, and we went out and serviced about 150 seniors that just didn't have the money and it's so rewarding, but that's where I'm at. That's why I'm looking to serve on this commission. Any questions?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Questions? Thank you very much, Edmund Portnoy?

[Time: 01:43:32]

Human Services Commission Applicant Edmund Portnoy: Thank you, Vice Mayor, Mayor Lane and members of council, my name is Edmund Portnoy, 9423 East Rosemont Drive and I have lived in Scottsdale for 30 years.

Human service commission is very special to me. I used to report to the human service division. I was hired in 1986 as the first manager of youth and family services for the city of Scottsdale and started the juvenile diversion program, town hall, the mayor's youth council and the youth employment program and several other programs and enjoyed five years with youth and family services. I then went to serve with Mayor Drinkwater and council as the executive assistant for a year, and then returned to the community services and human services and started the Scottsdale Cares program. Scottsdale Cares program says it raised over \$1 million in the last 20 years, but it has raised over \$2 million. It distributed over \$120 million to the Maricopa County focusing on youth and families predominantly. It's very important to me to see those programs that were started back in '86 continue, as well as to increase the resources for human services.

In terms of the biggest problems and what I see, we need to maximize resources and one of those resources, again, is Scottsdale cares and I do have a plan to increase the donations from Scottsdale cares from the early inception until now. When we started the program in 19 -- I worked here in '86 to '99. In '95, we wanted to let community know about the program and we sent letters to all the sure pay customers with an addressed -- self-addressed stamped envelope to have them reply back to us to allow us to take \$1 a month from their utility bill. 23% responded affirmatively and 23% was our figure saying if 23% of the sure pay will contribute, possibly 23% of the general population will. We went on to start the program after three months of prepping the community for the changes in the utility bill and with we introduced the program approximately 23% contributed it. But so it wasn't because of lack of knowledge or being fooled into contributing or any of those type of fears that surrounded the program at the time, it was very successful. And the past 20 years, sure pay customers have not been followed. In those 20 years, new residents have moved to Scottsdale. When I started in 1986, the population of Scottsdale was 87,000. And when I left, I think it was 133,000. But we need to remind that population of people who have sure pay and, again, request their permission to have them join the program.

That concludes my comments and I would be happy to answer any questions.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Questions? Thank you so much.

Human Services Commission Applicant Edmund Portnoy: Thank you.

[Time: 01:46:52]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Well, unfortunately, there's only one vacancy and there are five nominees. And this, again, is going to be very difficult. Let's start with Councilwoman Klapp.

Councilwoman Klapp: Jayne Hubbard.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Jayne Hubbard.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Edmund Portnoy.

Councilman Phillips: Edmund Portnoy.

Councilman Smith: Edmund Portnoy.

Councilmember Korte: Edmund Portnoy.

Mayor Lane: Edmund Portnoy.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: I believe Edmund Portnoy has been appointed. Thank you very much. Thank you, all of you.

#### **JUDICIAL APPOINTMENTS ADVISORY BOARD**

[Time: 01:47:30]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Our next board is the Judicial Appointments Advisory Board and there's one opening. The Judicial Appointments Advisory Board makes advisory recommendations to the city council regarding the appointment and reappointment of full-time city jobs. The seven member J.A.A.B. will have three citizens appointed, and that are not members of the State Bar of Arizona.

Sandra Schenkat's term expired September 10<sup>th</sup> and she's he will eligible for reappointment and has submitted an application for consideration. She represents a citizen position. There's one vacancy and one nominee. And the nominee is Sandra Schenkat. Sandra?

Judicial Appointments Advisory Board Applicant Sandra Schenkat: Good evening, Mayor Lane, Vice Mayor Littlefield and Councilmembers. My name is Sandra Schenkat, I reside at East Gary Road, 85259. I have been a permanent resident of Scottsdale for seven years.

I would appreciate your vote for my reappointment to Judicial Appointments Advisory Board to save a little time tonight, I made this real short. I don't want to reiterate what is in my application. And what you all would have seen back in September of -- September 10<sup>th</sup>, 2013. So if anybody wants to know who I really am what I think about, please go back and check that in the city website, but I'm interested in serving a second term.

The Scottsdale judges will be due for reevaluation in reappointment again in 2017. The J.A.A.B. serves you, the council well by reviewing the judge's work performance through personal survey of prosecutors and others serving in court. We give you our recommendations. This is an excellent check and balance for the city court system. With our population increase, I believe that J.A.A.B. will be assigned the task of evaluating a fifth judge in the near future. With over 10,000 cases being heard in Scottsdale city court annually, the citizens can trust that the most professional judges are employed by the city to create a fair and just system for all. Thank you. Any questions?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you. Questions? Thank you very much.

[Time: 01:50:22]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: We will begin the vote with Councilwoman Milhaven.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Sandy Schenkat.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Sandy Schenkat.

Councilmember Phillips: I will reaffirm Sandy Schenkat.

Councilman Smith: Sandy Schenkat.

Councilmember Korte: Sandy Schenkat.

Mayor Lane: Sandy Schenkat.

Councilwoman Klapp: Sandy Schenkat.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Sandy Schenkat has been reappointed. The council must appoint for reappoint members who are recommended by the Scottsdale Bar Association or the Arizona Superior Court. The Honorable Thomas L. LeClaire was unable to fulfill his membership term on the board. Chief Justice Scott Bales appointed the Honorable Bradley Astrowsky by administrative order number 2015-127. We will now be taking a vote to confirm the honorable Bradley Astrowsky's appointment.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Mr. Astrowsky.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Mr. Astrowsky.

Councilmember Phillips: Mr. Astrowsky.

Councilman Smith: The honorable Astrowsky.

Councilmember Korte: Mr. Bradley Astrowsky.

Mayor Lane: Vote to confirm Bradley Astrowsky.

Councilwoman Klapp: Bradley Astrowsky.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: He has been confirmed. Thank you very much.

### **LIBRARY BOARD**

[Time: 01:51:58]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: We can now move on to the Library Board where we have one opening. The Library Board advises the council on general policy relating to the programs, services and future development of the Scottsdale public libraries. Paulette Feeley resigned May 19<sup>th</sup> of this year.

There's one vacancy and there are four nominees. The nominees are Patricia Bauer, Sheila Collins, Sheila Reyman and Joseph Rubin. Sheila Collins and Sheila Reyman were not able to attend for interviews but they have submitted their answers to the Council in writing. So we will begin tonight with Patricia Bauer.

Library Board Applicant Patricia Bauer: Good evening, Councilmembers. My name is Patricia Bauer. I live at 13506 East Annex Court here in Scottsdale. I have lived there for 15 years.

I think that the library staff and the Library Board is doing an excellent job and I'm an avid reader. So I'm one of their best customers. I think there are probably one or two things that I would like to try to improve upon. As we have seen here tonight, Scottsdale is becoming an increasingly diverse community, and the Scottsdale library perhaps can do a little bit more to reflect that diversity by doing things like more books from authors outside the United States. My next door neighbors are from Afghanistan. Just down the street, I have neighbors from Mexico and from Tokyo. I would like to see more community outreach from the library to people here that and I think we can do that to bring them more into the community. I have also been to the M.I.M. and I have seen the events that they have highlighting different countries, music, dance from each of those countries will something like that might help with the library also, bringing people like -- from those countries into the community.

I'm not a teacher or a librarian. My background is corporate law which is probably not too helpful. But I have done a lot of volunteering and I also was given responsibility for a strategic business operation of a fortune 100 company where I've had to work with people from many foreign countries. So I kind of have some idea about how that might work with those folks. And that's why I'm interested in being on the Library Board. Any questions? Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you very much. I should also mention that Barbara Truelick has withdrawn her application. So she's not being considered here tonight. Next we have Joseph Rubin.

[Time: 01:55:47]

Library Board Applicant Joseph Rubin: It's truly an honor to be here with you this evening. My name is Joseph Rubin. I have only lived here eight months, moving from Fort Worth, Texas. I live at 8500 East Indian School Road here in Scottsdale. My move to Scottsdale came up suddenly, as I found myself to be a single person. I knew six people in Phoenix. I knew no one in Scottsdale. And I was very much alone.

So I inquired about the library and became a member where I could continue my love of reading and meeting new people. I signed up to be a volunteer and I was accepted, delighted. I became busy and reinstated a Sunday afternoon story stop opportunity for young children and family members which once again is proving very successful with lots of dads and moms accompanying their kids. I truly had found a wonderful place to be. The library was run extremely well with capable, talented people, volunteers were helpful, friendly, knowledgeable. Scottsdale has a Library Board similar to what I had experienced in Midland, Texas. Where I was a Library Board member for six years.

Here in this wonderful city and this exemplary library, I wanted to get involved with projects and activities developing your goals. Even with an outstanding program, there would be changes requiring new thinking, and staff and volunteers would be challenged to continue their superb work as they move forward. And it is obvious that a Library Board and administrators will continue to work together. It is my hope that by working together, partnerships can be developed within this community. The library and business organizations can come together to look at certain problems and situations and extend the services of the library by establishing what the Navajo nation calls a place for learning. Indeed, a library is a place for learning, much more than a place where you go to check out books and then return them.

The Navajos call this -- [ Speaking Navajo ] I consider extremely well prepared, with program design and development with over 50 years in education, including writing textbooks for publishers.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Sir.

Library Board Applicant Joseph Rubin: It has been a great ride. I thank you for the opportunity to be here this evening.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you very much. Are there any questions for Mr. Rubin. Thank you, sir.

[Time: 02:00:16]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: We currently have one vacancy and four nominees and this time being I will begin by voting for Sheila Collins. Councilman Phillips.

Councilmember Phillips: Joseph Rubin.

Councilman Smith: Sheila Collins.

Councilmember Korte: Patricia Bauer.

Mayor Lane: Patricia Bauer.

Councilwoman Klapp: Joseph Rubin.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Patricia Bauer.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Okay. We do not have four votes. So Sheila Reyman will be removed from consideration and we vote again. I will vote for Joseph Rubin.

Councilmember Phillips: Joseph Rubin.

Councilman Smith: Sheila Collins.

Councilmember Korte: Patricia Bauer.

Mayor Lane: Patricia Bauer.

Councilwoman Klapp: Patricia Bauer.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Patricia Bauer.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: All right. That is 3-3, Patricia Bauer and Joseph Rubin. We do it again.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Joseph Rubin.

Councilmember Phillips: Joseph Rubin.

Councilman Smith: Joseph Rubin.

Councilmember Korte: Patricia Bauer.

Mayor Lane: Patricia Bauer.

Councilwoman Klapp: Joseph Rubin

Councilwoman Milhaven: Patricia Bauer

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Joseph Rubin has been appointed.

**LOSS TRUST FUND BOARD**

[Time: 02:02:03]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: We move on now to the Loss Trust Fund Board. This is required by the state. The Loss Trust Fund Board makes recommendations to the city council regarding the administration of the lost trust fund, as specified in the Scottsdale city code, they shall appoint five joint trustees of whom no more than one should be a member of the city council and no more than one trustees may be a city employee.

Pauline Hecker resigned January 26<sup>th</sup>, of 2016, and Matthew Kleifield's term expired September 10<sup>th</sup> of this year and he's eligible for reappointment, however he's not submitted an application. There are two vacancies and there's one nominee and that's Russell Mosser.

Loss Trust Fund Board Applicant Russell Mosser: My name is Russ Mosser, Russell. I live at 7705 East Doubletree, number 34 in Scottsdale. If you appoint me to this board, I guarantee you, we are the loss trust fund not the lost trust fund.

My normal education is engineering and marking. I serve a great deal in a volunteer capacity. I have -- my wife and I have lived here eight months. We downsized from Paradise Valley, where we lived for 31 years. I served on the town council and police board. I have been on the board of railroad and mechanical society, which is a charity that benefits the railroad park and I tutor literacy at one of the grade schools Navajo and have been doing that for quite some time.

I'm not sure what is facing this board. I understand the need to advise the staff and advise the council on what is being done with the loss trust fund and the way losses are managed. I believe the overall focus should be on the stewardship of the trust fun itself and trying to come up with creative solutions to reduce the loss to the city. Questions?

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Any questions? Thank you so much.

[Time: 02:04:51]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Okay. We have one nominee, and each council person may vote one time, we'll begin with Councilman Phillips.

Councilmember Phillips: Russell Mosser.

Councilman Smith: Russell Mosser.

Councilmember Korte: Mr. Mosser.

Mayor Lane: Mr. Mosser, simply because he found the lost trust fund.

Councilwoman Klapp: Russell Mosser.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Mr. Mosser.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Mr. Mosser. Thank you so much. Mr. Mosser has been appointed. And thank you.

### **NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMISSION**

[Time: 02:05:29]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Next we have the Neighborhood Advisory Commission. There are two openings. The Neighborhood Advisory Commission consists of seven members would advise and make recommendations to the city council on policies, plans, strategies, and programs for the preservation, improvement and revitalization of Scottsdale's housing and neighborhoods.

Jordan Ledbetter resigned April 11<sup>th</sup> of 2016. Joe Meli's term expired July 9<sup>th</sup> of 2016, and he's eligible for reappointment. And has committed an application for reconsideration.

There are two vacancies and there are three nominees. We have had two nominees withdraw their applications. And Anne-Marie Chiapetta and Kay Sperduti. So they have been withdrawn from consideration for tonight. We will begin with Joe Meli.

Neighborhood Advisory Commission Applicant Joe Meli: Good evening Vice Mayor Littlefield and Mayor, and members of Council. I had the privilege of serving on the commission since 2013. I just finished my three-year term. Just prior to finishing that term, I was voted chairman for the commission. I have lived in Scottsdale 15 years. I live at 8607 East Preserve Way Scottsdale.

Our commission really has evolved in the last three years and what has come into sharp focus is not only is the McDowell corridor important, but it's the awareness of the neighborhoods within that, that we have tried diligently to make aware of what we're trying to do, as far as the spirit awards. If you recall, we granted the spirit awards to those in June. We granted them to the multifamily residence, single family residence and a business.

I think the continuing work should be we raise awareness of these programs and allow these residences and businesses to be involved and improve either their appearance in the neighborhood, give them motivation to do renovation and restoration in the neighborhood and continue to work on the one Scottsdale concept. The commission has done great work to continue that. So I ask you for the permission to work again, and I would like to be reappointed. Thank you very much.



Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you, Mr. Meli. Are there any questions? Thank you. Next we have Carol Miraldi.

[Time: 02:08:03]

Neighborhood Advisory Commission Applicant Carol Miraldi: Thank you, Mr. Mayor and Councilmembers. My name is Carol Miraldi and I live at 7909 East Joshua Tree Lane. I have been there for 19 years in our beautiful city.

I recently retired and one of the first things I decided to do was to figure out how to give back to the community I love so much. I can't think of a better commission than the one that helped to enhance our neighborhoods. Previously I served six years on the keep Scottsdale beautiful commission. We worked on the adopt a road program, a litter program, rock the house, among many others. And I really enjoyed the work. I took some time off because my job became a bit much and now I'm back.

I had 25 years' experience as a regional sales and operational manager for a retail company and I think that has taught me to work well with many different people, but one of the most important things it taught me is to listen to people and what they have to say before making suggestions or decisions on what to do with the issues. I believe that those skills would be very invaluable on any board or commission.

I imagine the top issue just to be maintaining the beauty of our city, but also at the same time keeping our residents happy. Reviewing projects carefully, that would enhance our neighborhoods by weighing the facts and listening to opinions before making suggestions, I think, would be the things that I could contribute. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Any questions from council. Thank you very much. Next we have Rachel Putman.

[Time: 02:10:20]

Neighborhood Advisory Commission Applicant Rachel Putnam: Hi, good evening, Mr. Mayor, esteemed council members. My name is Rachel Putnam. I live at 7536 East Virginia Avenue. I'm very excited to be celebrating my upcoming two-year Scottsdale anniversary on October 3<sup>rd</sup>.

And I'm pleased to be interviewing for an appointment to the Neighborhood Advisory Commission. Serving in the communities in which we live is something I have always been very passionate about and I feel that my professional and personal experiences align well to those outlined in the commission. When my husband and I were looking for our first home to purchase, there was no question that our heart was set on Scottsdale. With my husband coming from Colorado and myself from New Jersey, we knew we wanted to live in a place that exuded many of the qualities from our own Hometowns. Children playing in the parks, sidewalks lining our neighborhoods, great schools, and a really true sense of community.

Since moving here in October of 2014, we have embraced all that the city has to offer. From attending lectures at our local community centers, weekly library visits, riding our bikes throughout the town, our Saturday morning farmer's mark adventures, dog park trips enjoying endless festivals special events such as the 9/11 ceremony this past Sunday, baseball games, our semester trips, the desert oasis, the Scottsdale community college and taking our free trolley and eating at Scottsdale's many amazing dining venues and playing kickball in our local leagues we exemplify what it means be a proud Scottsdale citizens. We couldn't be more excited to start our family here in a place that now feels like home.

So you ask why do I want to serve on the Neighborhood Advisory Commission. I love Scottsdale and I want to see the city continue to thrive in its diversity and offer endless opportunities to its citizens and most importantly continue to uphold its name of its most livable city. I feel that my experiences, educational, professional and philanthropic align well with the Neighborhood Advisory Commission. And ensure that the community in which we live continues to grow and prosper.

Like most individuals, I do not end up pursuing a career with my major which is hotel restaurant management but took quite a different turn by working with some of the top financial institutions over the past 12 years. I held positions in just about every aspect of the financial industry, including card services, payment processing, strategy, investment and leadership roles across all of these. I currently serve as a manager for Chase Commerce Solutions. I feel this role mirrors the qualities that would be necessary for the Neighborhood Advisory Commission in that I provide guidance, suggest and execute on process improvements and choose my business strategies and focus on our clients.

I think the biggest opportunity that we have in the commission is really remembering what the importance of Scottsdale and why people come to live here is that it's truly a fence of community and we need to ensure that we continue to make this prosper. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you very much. Are there any questions? Thank you.

[Time: 02:13:44]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Okay. Each councilmember can vote for two nominees. Went begin with Councilman Smith.

Councilman Smith: Thank you Vice Mayor, Joe Meli and Carol Miraldi.

Councilmember Korte: Carol Miraldi and Rachel Putnam.

Mayor Lane: Joe Meli and Carol Miraldi.

Councilwoman Klapp: Joe Meli and Rachel Putnam.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Joe Meli and Rachel Putnam.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Carol Miraldi and Rachel Putman.

Councilmember Phillips: Joe Meli and Carol Miraldi.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Okay, Joe Meli and Carol Miraldi have been appointed. Thank you so very much.

### **TOURISM DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION**

[Time: 02:14:43]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: All right. We have the Tourism Development Commission next. This is our final board. Tourism Development Commission advises the city council on matters concerning the expenditure of revenues from the transaction privilege tax on transient lodging the bed tax designated for tourism development. As specified in the Scottsdale city code, the seven members of Tourism Development Commission shall consist of representatives of the tourism industry in Scottsdale. Including -- it will be a minimum of four Scottsdale hoteliers. One member of the Scottsdale convention and visitors bureau and a balance from the elements of tourism industry.

Ace Bailey's term expired September 21<sup>st</sup> of this year and she represents a hotelier position. She's not eligible for reappointment. There's one vacancy and one nominee. The nominee is Frank Ashmore.

Tourism Development Commission Applicant Frank Ashmore: Good evening Mayor Lane, and Vice Mayor, my name is Frank Ashmore. I'm a 22 year resident of Scottsdale. I live at 7535 East Buteo Drive in Grayhawk.

I'm really excited about this opportunity to join the TDC. I'm excited to seven and be a resource to this council, my fellow residents of the community, and the business owners and the visitors that will be coming in. I know that my experience as a broad range in this industry, spending 25 years in the luxury hotel market and I lived in seven different countries and served five different communities here in Arizona and I know that I can help to give great recommendations with regards to the use of our bed tax and the right resources to bring the special events to our city.

I really feel that the top issue facing the TDC is to continue to be responsible, think about all the great development that's gone on here, but also the special events that bring and attract some wonderful visitors, people like myself who visited at one time and ended up becoming a resident of this great city and bringing resources to the full fruition. I have a great relationship with the ask the CVB and I serve on the Super Bowl committee, three different chambers of commerce here in Arizona and worked for some very wonderful private companies that understand how to use resource dollars in order to maximize the bed tax dollars and the opportunities to create a brand that Scottsdale is known for and I look forward to being of service in that regard.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Thank you so much. Questions?

[Time: 0:17:04]

Vice Mayor Littlefield: We begin the vote with Councilmember Korte.

Councilmember Korte: Mr. Ashmore.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Mayor?

Mayor Lane: Mr. Ashmore.

Councilwoman Klapp: Frank Ashmore.

Councilwoman Milhaven: Frank Ashmore.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Frank Ashmore

Councilmember Phillips: Frank Ashmore.

Councilman Smith: It's a squeaker, Frank Ashmore.

Vice Mayor Littlefield: Frank Ashmore has been appointed. Thank you so much.

This concludes our interview and appointment process for this afternoon or this evening. I would like to thank everyone that interviewed today, and I would also like to say, I am so impressed once again with all of the applicants that applied for our boards and commissions. Please remember even if you were not appointed tonight, your application will remain on file for one year for future consideration if there are additional vacancies. The city of Scottsdale is very lucky to have such dedicated and talented individuals who are willing and ready to serve our city and for that, I thank you all.

Mayor, I would like to turn the meeting back over to you. Thank you.

Mayor Lane: Thank you, Vice Mayor. Not only there great candidates but a great distribution throughout the city, looking at some of the ZIP codes we have been drawing upon.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

[Time: 02:18:47]

Mayor Lane: I thank everybody who did apply but thanks very much, and with that, I would offer or ask for a motion to adjourn.

Councilmembers: So moved.

Councilmembers: Second.

Mayor Lane: Moved and seconded. All of those in favor of adjournment, please indicate by aye.  
We are adjourned. Thank you very much.