
This document was created from the closed caption transcript of the May 17, 2022 City Council Special meeting and has not been checked for completeness or accuracy of content.

A copy of the agenda for this meeting, including a summary of the action taken on each agenda item, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/Assets/ScottsdaleAZ/Council/current-agendas-minutes/2022-agendas/05-17-22-special-agenda.pdf>

An unedited digital video recording of the meeting, which can be used in conjunction with the transcript, is available online at:

<https://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/scottsdale-video-network/council-video-archives/2022-archives>

For ease of reference, included throughout the transcript are bracketed “time stamps” [Time: 00:00:00] that correspond to digital video recording time.

For more information about this transcript, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 480-312-2411.

CALL TO ORDER

[Time: 00:00:00]

Mayor Ortega: Good afternoon. I call the May 17th, 2022 special meeting and possible executive session to order. City Clerk Ben Lane, will you please conduct the roll call.

ROLL CALL

[Time: 00:00:17]

Clerk Lane: Thank you, Mayor. Mayor David Ortega.

Mayor Ortega: Present.

Clerk Ben Lane: Vice Mayor Tammy Caputi.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Here.

Clerk Ben Lane: Councilmembers Tom Durham.

Councilmember Durham: Here.

Clerk Ben Lane: Betty Janik.

Councilmember Janik: Present.

Clerk Ben Lane: Kathy Littlefield.

Councilmember Littlefield: Here.

Clerk Ben Lane: Linda Milhaven.

Councilmember Milhaven: Here.

Clerk Ben Lane: Solange Whitehead.

Councilmember Whitehead: Here.

Clerk Ben Lane: City Manager Jim Thompson.

Jim Thompson: Here.

Clerk Ben Lane: City Attorney Sherry Scott.

Sherry Scott: Here.

Clerk Ben Lane: City Treasurer Sonia Andrews.

Sonia Andrews: Here.

Clerk Ben Lane: And the Clerk is Present. Thank you, Mayor.

[Time: 00:00:39]

Mayor Ortega: Excellent. Our items as posted include number one, the request for executive session. May I have a motion to adjourn into executive session to discuss and consult with the city's attorneys for legal advice and discuss and consult with designated representatives of the city to consider its position and instruct its representatives regarding a class of Scottsdale firefighters' claim against the public safety personnel retirement system related to the alleged wrongful restriction of purchasing past service credit, the related potential financial impact and/or liability to the city arising out of such a legal claim, a proposed settlement/resolution of this dispute and potential negotiations regarding the same. May I have a motion.

Councilmember Janik: I move to move into executive session.

Councilmember Littlefield: Second.

Councilmember Durham: Second.

Mayor Ortega: I hear a motion and a second. Please register your vote. Thank you. That's unanimous. We will be recessing in executive session, however, we will be returning to our special session directly from the executive.

[Executive session]

[Time: 00:03:46]

Mayor Ortega: We are resuming our special session. We completed the executive session. We are moving on to item number 2, which is the appointment of boards and commissions and task forces. We have interviews and appointments.

I will now turn the meeting over to Vice Mayor Caputi for the boards, commissions, and task force interviews and appointments.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you, Mayor. The Scottsdale City Council is responsible for establishing City policies and enacting laws in support of those policies. The Council relies on volunteer, citizen-based boards and commissions to research issues and make recommendations in support of the Council's mission and goals.

The information and recommendations provided by council-appointed advisory boards is a valuable tool in helping Councilmembers in their deliberations. This afternoon, the City Council will be appointing Scottsdale residents interested in serving on various boards and commissions. I want to thank the individuals for their willingness to volunteer their time in service to this community.

Following the set of interviews, we'll vote on an appointment for the board or commission. As I call your name, please approach the podium, and briefly cover the following: For the record, please state your name and address and how long you have lived in Scottsdale. Please tell us how your education, employment, or volunteer experience relates to this board or commission. What is the top issue facing this board or commission? Please limit your comments to two minutes. We have a timer by the screen to help you manage your time. Following each nominee's response, I will ask Councilmembers if they have any follow-up questions for you.

BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT

[Time: 00:05:38]

Vice Mayor Caputi: So to start, the board of adjustment is a quasi-judicial body that hears variance requests, appeals of the Zoning Administrator's interpretation/decisions, and decides on administrative decisions or zoning requirements, which create unnecessary hardships in the development of property because of exceptional or extraordinary conditions. That's a really long sentence!

[Laughter]

There is one vacancy and one Nominee. The nominee is: Gary Donahoe. Mr. Donahoe, if you could please approach the podium, and you have two minutes.

Gary Donahoe: Mayor, Vice Mayor, good afternoon. My name is Gary Donahoe, I live at 8613 east San Lorenzo drive, in Scottsdale. I lived at that address for eight years. My relevant experience and education include I have over 30 years of legal and judicial experience. I also hold a master's degree in urban planning. I've had experience a number of years experiences in urban planner.

I worked for the northern Arizona council of governments, and during that stint, I advised -- or acted as a city planner for a number of small communities and towns in northern Arizona, including writing zoning ordinances.

[Time: 00:07:06]

I think the challenges that face the board of adjustment continually are making sure that everyone gets due process, a fair hearing, fair adjudication of the application based on the facts presented, as well as the law. And I think it's important for board members to articulate their decision so that the applicant understands why the decision was made and should there be an appeal so that the superior court can determine that the decision was an arbitrary and capricious.

I don't -- I don't know -- it says zero here. So I guess I'm out of time.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Yeah, that's weird. It doesn't start.

Gary Donahoe: Thank you for the opportunity to serve. If you have any questions, I'm happy to answer them.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Oh, there's the timer. Oh, look at that, you lucked out.

Gary Donahoe: I still have two minutes.

[Laughter]

Vice Mayor Caputi: Right? If no one has any questions.

Mayor Ortega: I move we approve commissioner position for board of adjustment Gary Donahoe.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Can we do that? Okay. Mayor says Gary Donahoe. Why don't we just go in

order. Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilmember Littlefield: No additional.

Vice Mayor Caputi: I think you have to say the name.

Councilmember Littlefield: Gary Donahoe.

Councilmember Janik: Gary Donahoe.

Councilmember Durham: Gary Donahoe.

Vice Mayor Caputi: I vote for Gary Donahoe.

Councilmember Whitehead: Mr. Donahoe.

Councilmember Milhaven: Gary Donahoe.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Mr. Donahoe, you have been appointed. Congratulations.

HUMAN SERVICES COMMISSION

[Time: 00:09:00]

Vice Mayor Caputi: The human services commission provides advisory recommendations to staff and the City Council on human services priorities and programs, and funding allocations for Scottsdale Cares, Community Development Block Grants, HOME, Human Services Emergency and General Funds. There are three vacancies and three nominees. The nominees are: Patrick Dodds, Mary Jung, Stuart Turgel.

Mr. Dodds, if you would like to approach the podium, you have two minutes. And it looks like the timer is up now.

Pat Dodds: Vice Mayor, members of the council, Mayor, I'm Pat Dodds. My address is 8614 east citrus way. My wife is a native. So 41 years ago, she brought me here and I got a good deal out of that. My relevant experience for the commission includes 24-year career with the city. I worked also many years as a volunteer with nonprofits. I'm not an expert, but I hope that I can provide good sounding board for the staff and the commission. And for you.

I started with the city in 1986. I was one of a string of young assistants who tried to keep up with Mayor Herb Drinkwater, who was hyperactive and hyper optimistic. He was an inspiration. I served the city as a government relations coordinator, lobbyist for the city at the Arizona legislature. Later on, as your public information officer. And I was -- I was responsible for, in some cases, keeping these microphones working, which was a terrifying job!

Finally -- well, I served on two nonprofits that deal with homelessness, family promise of greater Phoenix and bridging Arizona, which provides furniture to homeless families. I did a year as an AmeriCorps volunteer recently, writing grants. A top issue facing the commission, and their most -- in their most recent annual report says that the top issue is affordable housing. I agree with that. That's been a perennial issue in Scottsdale. There's no silver bullet. It's a multilayered issue. It's something that we need to keep working at.

I think Scottsdale excels at tackling big problems with sustained leadership and commitment. And incremental progress is progress. We keep at it, whether it's getting a lot of attention or not, and that makes me proud as a citizen. So I want to thank you. Having served here, I know all the work you do and I want to thank these folks for applying for a commission membership. You are serving me too as a fellow citizen.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you. Any questions for Mr. Dodds? All right. Well, then we will now hear from Mary and I want to say it's Jung, but if I pronounce your name incorrectly, please correct me.

[Time: 00:12:19]

Mary Jung: Thank you, Mayor and Vice Mayor. It's pronounced Jung. The way to remember it, it's the same pronunciation as jungle. My name is Mary Jung I live at 9163 East Nittany Drive in Scottsdale, 85255 and I lived in the city of Scottsdale for three years. And with my career citizens as a certified public accountant, a C.P.A., in finance, in economic development, in higher Ed and now in healthcare, I want to bring those experiences to benefit the citizens of Scottsdale.

I recently earned a certificate in diversity, equity and inclusion, and I plan to incorporate those concepts. My experiences in the nonprofit sector from being hands on, including at the city of Scottsdale holiday gift drive, to being on the board of united way in different communities and here locally at the partners for Paiute, I plan to bring those experiences to bear for the benefit of the citizens of Scottsdale as well.

And lastly, on a personal note, my husband and I are caregivers for my father-in-law and my mother and I intend to bring those firsthand experiences to bear for the citizens of Scottsdale as well.

I think one of the greatest challenges that we all have in many roles, is stewardship, and I think that is one of the greatest challenges for the human services commission, is being a steward of the resources that we have, including our dedicated employees.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Great. Thank you. Does anyone have any questions for Ms. Jung? If not, thank you very much.

Mary Jung: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Caputi: We will hear from Stuart Turgel. I have been a resident of Scottsdale since 2006. I appreciate your consideration of my application to serve on the human services commission. For more than 50 years, my personal and professional life have been -- professional life have been dedicated first as a Army broadcast journalist.

Most of my career was spent in pediatric healthcare and biomedical research organizations as a children's hospital's executive one of my major responsibilities was in the area of government affairs.

One of my proudest accomplishments was child health public policy where I worked with my colleagues across the country to advance and ultimately succeed in the design and passage of the children's health insurance passage program, administered by Health and Human Services. In 2013 I retired as the president of the Jewish.

I served as chairman of the city of the Carlsbad, California, cable television commission, I have been a volunteer with refugee aid, a community-based all volunteer organization assisting in the resettlement and feeding of refugee families seeking asylum. I served as president of the Arizona community media foundation which operates radio Phoenix, a public access radio station.

[Time: 00:16:08]

I was the chair of the northeast regional partnership council of first things first which is Arizona's early childhood development and health board providing support to programs for children 0 through 5 throughout the state of Arizona. And I was a volunteer with the Arizona talking book library.

I'm a certified mentor with SCORE, a national nonprofit organization, helping small businesses and nonprofits get off the ground, and I'm on the board of Duet, partners in health and aging which provides free services to homebound adults and assistants to grandparents raising grandchildren.

I believe that every citizen should be free from food insecurity and free from being unsheltered and treated with dignity and private individuals despite their economic status and condition. I do agree that the homelessness and housing challenges perhaps are the greatest issue facing our community right now, but I don't think that's the only agenda that we should be dealing with. Thank you very much.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Great. Thank you so much. Does anyone have any questions for Mr. Turgel? I will now entertain a vote for the human services commission. We'll start with Councilwoman Littlefield.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Patrick Dodds, Mary Jung, and Stuart Turgel.

Councilmember Janik: Patrick Dodds, Mary Jung, Stuart Turgel.

Councilmember Durham: Patrick Dodds, Mary Jung, and Stuart Turgel.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Patrick Dodds, Mary Jung, Stuart Turgel.

Councilmember Whitehead: Patrick Dodds, Mary Jung, Stuart Turgel.

Councilmember Milhaven: Mr. Dodds, Ms. Jung, and Mr. Turgel.

Vice Mayor Caputi: We will never get your name wrong again.

Mayor Ortega: Patrick Dodds, Mary Jung, and Stuart Turgel.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Perfect. The three have been appointed.

LIBRARY BOARD

[Time: 00:18:19]

Vice Mayor Caputi: The Library Board advises the City Council on general policy relating to the programs, services, and future development of the Scottsdale Public Libraries. There is one vacancy and one nominee. The nominee is: Marna McLendon. Ms. McLendon's term expires this month and is eligible for reappointment. And she's already up. So that's fantastic.

Marna McLendon: Good afternoon, Mayor, Vice Mayor, council people. It's great to be here. Thank you very much for having me. I'm Marna McLendon. 2467 North 117 Street in north, North Scottsdale up by Troon for 20 years. We're staying. We love it!

My experience has been thanking you for the service I have been able to give on the library board for the last three years. Because of that, I have seen my role as a cheerleader. I learned so much from the staff. I have the honor and the pleasure to work with our director Keira Peters. And I think being a cheerleader is sometimes very important.

I also feel that I need to be visible to community, to staff, to the council. I struggle sometimes with understanding what my best role would be to assist you in making some of the decisions you have to make. I have heard that I provide some critical thinking and good, solid analysis on some of the issues that we need to converse about. I hope that's true. I want to bring that to the library board. The issues, we want to get back to where we were in 2019. Prior to everything, budget issues because of COVID.

So our programs are starting back up and that will help us with the numbers because we're somewhat numbers driven in terms of budget analyses. Our volunteers are coming back. That's going to mean more services, more programs to our community. And our materials budget is starting to come back up. Thank you for that.

Because I have heard about the long holds that people have to wait for their books, and the lack of some digital materials that they really want. So my question will always be, how best can we serve you? I want to thank you. I have loved the opportunity and I hope to be able to do another three years. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you for your service. Any questions for Ms. McLendon. If not, then let's entertain a vote for library board. I will start with Councilwoman Janik.

Councilmember Janik: Marna McLendon.

Councilmember Durham: Marna McLendon.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Marna McLendon.

Councilmember Whitehead: McLendon.

Councilmember Milhaven: McLendon.

Mayor Ortega: Marna McLendon.

Councilmember Littlefield: And Marna McLendon.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Congratulations, Marna McLendon has been appointed.

MCDOWELL SONORAN PRESERVE COMMISSION

[Time: 00:21:19]

Vice Mayor Caputi: The McDowell Sonoran Preserve Commission provides citizen oversight for acquisition, preservation, management and stewardship of the McDowell Mountain and related Sonoran Desert for the benefit of this And future generations. There is one vacancy and four nominees. The nominees are: Scott Bartle, Savannah Engelking, Robert Hallagan, Mike Savastio. Mr. Bartle, if you would like to come up to the podium.

Scott Bartle: Thank you, Mayor, Vice Mayor, my name is Scott Bartle. Pardon my post-cold voice and throat. I live at 10725 east Palomino road in Scottsdale Ranch. I moved to the great city of Scottsdale in 1977 at the tender age of 5 years old and aside from going back to Indiana for college and a stint in the city of Maricopa County, I have been a proud resident since.

My education, profession and volunteer all contribute to being an effective member of the commission. I have participated and graduated from several area leadership development groups. My professional experience is predominantly in marketing, media, and public relations. And I have volunteered on and chaired a city committee, and served as an elected official and I believe that experience adds to a foundational understanding of how government works and

how elected and their constituents think.

While various hot button issues arise from time to time, the overarching goal I would prioritize is the commission's purpose of establishing a preserve in perpetuity. Ensuring the preserve's sustainability first and foremost. I think it's important to add that if you are seeking an activist for this role, I'm not your guy. I'm not looking to save every prairie dog, nor am I looking to develop every acre of mountain viewed land.

I merely would like to serve in capacity in which my objective would be to make fiscally sound decisions, consistent with the charter of the preserve. Thank you very much for your service and for your consideration.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you. Any questions for Mr. Bartle? All right. Thank you so much. We will now hear from Savannah Engelking.

[Time: 00:24:01]

Savannah Engelking: Hi, everybody, my name is Savannah Engelking. I live at 5877 north granite reef in Scottsdale, 85250. I was born in Arizona and I have lived here in Scottsdale for my entire life. In addition to my academic and professional experience in nonprofit organization and management, I spend most of my free time working for various animal rehabilitation organizations and state land management agencies.

I have worked to rescue, relocate and rehabilitate both domestic and wild animals with various agencies in the state. Through my work as a National Park Service volunteer and education intern, I have learned about cultural resources and natural resources regarding land management within a park or preserve. My work as an Arizona site steward protecting archaeological sites across the state has furthered my knowledge of protecting them.

My work as a Phoenix park steward at the south mountain greenhouse has given me a deeper knowledge of the desert flora and fauna and how important it is to preserve and protect and maintain it.

It may seem obvious but the top issue facing the commission is to work with our constituents to preserve the preserve for future generations and as subject matter experts, advise on the best way to achieve that.

With more of the urban public visiting parks, preserves and engaging in outdoor activities than ever before, we have a new and exciting opportunity to not only protect the preserve and in perpetuity, but to educate the public on topics like ebikes and wildlife corridors and maintenance of the land, to help them connect with the natural and cultural resources in a way that not only helps them connect with the land, but makes our residents an ally to our preservation efforts.

Of course, another hugely important issue and one that you will be voting on shortly is possibly continuing the preserve tax. Thank you for your time.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you. Any questions for Ms. Engelking? Okay. Then thank you very much. We will hear from Robert Hallagan next.

Robert Hallagan: Thank you for the opportunity to speak today. My name is Robert Hallagan. I live at 29251 north 71st way in Scottsdale. My wife and I have been residence there since September 2003. We have lived off and on in Arizona, down in Cochise County since 1977.

Speaking to the experiences, I am a lead steward for the McDowell Sonoran Conservancy. I participate in three programs, patrol, trailhead ambassador and citizen science. The first two give me near daily interaction with visitors to the preserve, and I hear their comments. I hear their compliments and I hear their questions.

And the third program, citizen science, I'm the lead for the Sonoran desert's tortoise study that we're conducting under an Arizona heritage fund grant. And because that study takes place off trail, it gives me the most intimate boots on the ground look at the preserve in areas not accessible to the public. And I see up close the state of the preserve, the land, the plants, the animals and the good and the bad.

[Time: 00:27:36]

I am a Harvard Kennedy school of government senior executive fellow in public policy. The emphasis of that postgrad education was on developing within us the leadership frameworks for senior public service.

Lastly, I'm a retired Army intelligence officer and retired executive from general dynamics mission systems right here in Scottsdale. And subsequently, I have strong skills in requirements analysis, budgeting planning, controlling, reviewing programs. Top issue facing the board, I think there are two, actually, they are related. And I know working groups are being formed where the commission will have a play. The first is the upcoming expiration of the tax funding for fence acquisition. And the second is funding for sustainment then of what we do have in the preserve. That's what I think are the top two. Thank you again for the opportunity to speak. I look forward to serving and it's very exciting to come to city hall and speak to the council.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you Mr. Hallagan. Does anyone have any questions? All right. Well, then lastly, we'll hear from Mike Savastio.

Mike Savastio: Good evening, my name is Mike Savastio, my address is 9935 east water drive in Sweetwater ranch and I have been a resident of Scottsdale for a total of 24 years.

My leadership and community service experience includes previous stints on boards at the Arizona association for home care, and the rotary club of Scottsdale of which I have been a

member for 18 years.

Most recently, I just completed Scottsdale leadership class 36, where our project lead it forward group set an all-time record fund-raising to benefit the child crisis of Arizona organization. My goal as part of the commission would be to use my skills and affinity for youth to help expand existing programs that would further engage the younger generation.

This would serve to secure the future of the preserve itself, as well as creating sort of a succession plan for the stewards. Biggest issue as mentioned earlier, that I agree with is facing the commission is how to handle the expiring tax in 2025. There's a lot of factors to be considered.

First off, to confirm that it, indeed should be extended and if so, should it be extended at perhaps a slightly lower rate? Additionally, in contrast to the expiring tax, that can only be used for land acquisition, should an extension be allowed for other items in the preserve, such as maintenance and additional trail heads and also perhaps for other areas of need within the city and other parts of the city, such as the park system, Indian bend wash or even the harts.

I can't give you any magic actions, those are the issues that I feel need to be analyzed and discussed in the coming months and years and ultimately put back to the voters. Thank you for your consideration.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you, Mr. Savastio. Any questions from council? Otherwise, we will entertain a vote for the McDowell Sonoran Preserve. Each one can vote for one nominee. We will start with councilman Durham.

[Time: 00:31:04]

Councilmember Durham: Savannah Engelking.

Vice Mayor Caputi: I will nominate Robert Hallagan

Councilmember Whitehead: Savannah Engelking.

Councilmember Milhaven: Mr. Savastio

Mayor Ortega: Savannah Engelking.

Councilwoman Littlefield: Savannah Engelking.

Councilwoman Janik: Savannah Engelking.

Vice Mayor Caputi: I believe Ms. Engelking has been appointed.

PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION

[Time: 00:31:40]

The Parks and Recreation Commission advises the City Council on the acquisitions of lands and facilities for use as parks or recreation centers; and on the operation, use, care and maintenance of these parks and recreation areas. There is one vacancy and one nominee. The nominee is: Maryann McAllen.

Ms. McAllen's term expires this month and is eligible for reappointment. She is unable to join us this afternoon, but very much would like to be reappointed to the commission. I will now entertain a vote for the Parks and Recreation Commission. Who are we up to? I believe me and I'm going to nominate or appoint, MaryAnn McAllen.

Councilmember Whitehead: MaryAnn McAllen.

Councilmember Milhaven: McAllen.

Mayor Ortega: Mary Ann McAllen.

Councilmember Littlefield: MaryAnn McAllen.

Councilmember Janik: MaryAnn McAllen.

Councilmember Durham: MaryAnn McAllen.

Vice Mayor Caputi: MaryAnn McAllen has been appointed.

PLANNING COMMISSION

[Time: 00:32:48]

Vice Mayor Caputi: The Planning Commission holds public meetings and makes recommendations to the City Council on all matters relating to the creation of zoning districts, the enforcement of zoning regulations, amendments to all zoning ordinances and any other planning and zoning issue.

Anthony Leavy has withdrawn his application from consideration. There are two vacancies and eight nominees. The nominees are: Jeff Brand, Laurie Coe, Robert Fishman, Jason Heetland, Renee Higgs, whose term expires this month and is eligible for reappointment, Michal Ann Joyner, Diana Kaminski, Ed Peaser.

Mr. Brand, if you would approach the podium, you have two minutes to speak.

Jeff Brand: Good afternoon, Mayor, Vice Mayor and councilmembers. My name is Jeff Brand. I live at 8128 east Mitchell drive, just down the street at Hayden and Osborn. I lived in Scottsdale

in that home for 12 years. My wife was born in Scottsdale and I have two kids currently in the Scottsdale unified school district. Needless to say, we will be here for a while.

I'm applying for planning commission. I'm an architect locally here in Scottsdale for about 23 years now. So I do both building design and master planning. I'm currently a member of the development review board, but applying to the planning commission because really master planning and planning in general is a focus of what my expertise is and what I do every day. So I worked for Nelson partners for 23 years. I'm a partner there. I'm a director of the design department.

The work that we work and oversee is all master planning work. What I'm seeing both locally, regionally and nationally, are issues that are going to cause a lot of concern for cities moving forward. There's been a shift in uses, with how people work, how people live, how restaurants and retail operate and just how the general picture of how life happens. All of these things regarding uses and the relationship between uses is what I'm tackling and looking at and advising upon through public/private partnerships and just some of these private entities about how to develop and tackle these issues and have great master plans and great planning moving forward. That's what I do all day long.

I saw and read the description for the planning commission, and the planning commission's job is to essentially provide expertise and advisement to city council and city council as elected officials, you know, you approve things but the planning commission is really a body that provides a level of professional expertise and I would like to contribute professional expertise, to give advisement and not to push decisions.

[Time: 00:35:59]

But to tell you what I'm seeing across the country in different cities and tell you what I'm seeing and the effects of different planning moves and things that are happening, not just here but in other cities in Arizona and -- did the two minutes not start?

Vice Mayor Caputi: You're doing a great job.

Jeff Brand: Sorry. I will cut it off there and I hope you guys will consider my application.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Perfect. Hang on one moment. Does anyone have any questions for Mr. Brand?

Mayor Ortega: Here's a quick question.

Jeff Brand: Sure.

Mayor Ortega: Mr. Brand, so in the local market you may be using sub designers or other

professionals, engineers, perhaps, sustainability people, you are aware, of course, the conflict of interest which if you had a case you wouldn't be voting on it. How do you feel if you happen to use the same subconsultant that came before with another project that came before you. You weren't the prime architect but you basically use the whole team on your own projects?

Jeff Brand: Yeah, I would think that on a case-by-case basis, if I felt I would get the advice of the city attorney, and if I felt and the attorney felt there was any sort of conflict of interest, I would absolutely abstain or remove myself from that case. Yeah, there's no -- I have served on the review board for a little over a year and it's been the exact same protocol for removing yourself, of course, from any case that you would have any unbiased opinion on.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Well, I definitely have questions. I think this is one of the most important boards we have. That's why we have all of these politics. I think a lot of our citizens recognize that. On council, we rely on the planning commission when we evaluate projects that come before you.

I know I often will call members of our planning commission when I need extra help and I feel very strongly that we need commissioners who will review cases and provide us with their professional unbiased fact-based recommendations that meet the criteria of our city code, not just an opinion.

So Mr. Brand, you have been a valuable member of our DRB, as you mentioned and I appreciate your expertise. Could you please tell us in a little bit more detail how your education, employment or volunteer experience specifically relates to this planning commission and your ability to advise council on issues of planning and zoning in particular?

Jeff Brand: Sure. I would be happy to expound on that. Without going into detail about projects that are currently working on, just a snippet of background. I'm currently working up in the Salt Lake City area to address a number of urban planning issues reviewing quality control for the daybreak community there.

[Time: 00:38:53]

We are designing an entire infill for a 300-acre city called vineyard and we are doing that in conjunction with Jeff speck, who is the national authority on walkable cities. We are implementing the first walkable city master plan in this region. I'm working with goodyear, the city of goodyear on a public/private master planning effort down to redesign their downtown area adjacent to city hall.

Obviously I was working on the replanning in conjunction for the city of Phoenix, at the Paradise Valley mall. So we are doing all master planning at Paradise Valley mall. I'm working with Queen

Creek and the city of Queen Creek about how to have private/public partnerships through the RFP process and enhance their downtown vision and how to actually make that happen. I'm working with the city of Gilbert about the walkability to extend in and out of heritage district.

I'm also participating in all of their transportation workshops to help them understand the different uses and the architecture changes in transportation. I'm working in Tempe as a liaison request the ASU real estate department on the Novus project to make sure there's viability on the Novus campus.

I will be participating in the technical panel which is what cities -- essentially it's the function to go in and provide assistance to cities. And locally here in Scottsdale, there's a number of projects that we have worked on, but most recently, I have been working with staff as a liaison for the construction cost mechanism for the staff to be able to relook at downtown development bonus standards.

And we recently completed a project or our sustainability director and our office, we are reaching out to the city to make sure that the sustainability efforts that are mandated through the zoning process, there's actually a method in which those get tracked and implemented because we recently had a project the senate house hotel where there was an I.G.A., an I.G.C.C., Scottsdale green building code was mandated through zoning but through the -- through the tracking of permitting there really wasn't an implementation plan.

[Time: 00:41:36]

Now, on that project we submitted for green globes and we had to go through a certification plan because of that, but there was nothing that we had to do through the permitting process or occupancy process that was done.

So we've contacted Lisa McNeilly with the new head of sustainability and we are working with her to make sure that sustainability efforts mandated through zoning track and have an implementation mechanism through building permits and through occupancy. So.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you. Wow, that was way more extensive than I was expecting.

Jeff Brand: I ran out of time.

Vice Mayor Caputi: No, it's all good. Any other questions, otherwise we --

Mayor Ortega: Just a quick question. Were you involved in the Old Town character area plan in 2018?

Jeff Brand: I'm sorry?

Mayor Ortega: Were you involved --

Jeff Brand: No. No, I was not.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you, Mr. Brand. Ms. Coe, if you would like to approach the podium.

Laurie Coe: Mayor, Vice Mayor, council, my name is Laurie Coe. I live at 9125 east wood drive, and I lived at that residence for about 17 years. I'm honored that you would even consider me for this position open the planning commission, especially since the last speaker spoke. Please don't write me off, though, because I am qualified.

I have been an Arizona resident since 1978. I chose to live in Scottsdale because it is the most beautiful thriving city in the valley. A place I truly call home and a Hometown to love. As a licensed Realtor since 1987 and a broker since 1990, I have experienced Scottsdale's growth both as a resident and real estate professional.

I have witnessed the ups and downs the real estate market through facilitating the homes. And as a veteran of Scottsdale 101, Scottsdale, fire, police and water academies and as a member of the western spirit museum, I place a high value on our heritage.

Serving on the human relations commission for six years and chair for one, I have seen the impact of a city that celebrates diversity. The mutual understandings created are fundamental to a healthy community and I thank you all for that opportunity. As a mediator, a student of active listening and of nonviolent communication, I participate at Arizona town hall, a consensus building nonprofit working with municipalities.

[Time: 00:44:12]

Serving on the board of Scottsdale community partners we contract with Scottsdale social services to fund and help implement programs like empty bowls back-to-school, healthy planning. The planning commission is the bridge between the council, the city staff, developers and the citizenry.

My understanding of land use, land rules and land regulations, my ability to read a plat map and architectural plans gives me the insights that the planning commission needs. I commit to listen to all parties, doing on-site visits to proposed projects and if I don't understand, I will ask questions and seek help.

Our legacy is a community that we can work together for, for the common good. I have an open mind with no hidden or personal agendas. I'm not using this appointment as a career stepping stone. I will study each project that comes before the commission and will not make any crucial

decision until I have learned as much as possible. Please don't write me off from joining this commission. Any questions?

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you. Does anyone have any questions? I have a couple of questions, actually. You sent us an awful lot of background information and so I read it. I just wanted to ask a few questions about what you sent us. Some of the things that you said every viewpoint and the main issuing for planning and zoning was bringing people together.

I'm not quite sure how that's planning commission's main issue but since you were highlighting it, I just -- I was recently at a public meeting with you, where people were actually rudely shut down and I found that kind of interesting. People with different viewpoints actually didn't get a chance to speak.

And so I was wondering if you could give me an example of a time when you heard an opposing view with an open mind and then you modified your position and helped to bring people together?

Laurie Coe: Hmm. Well, that's interesting. I was at that table and I didn't know that person. I really was flummoxed by the rude behavior of another person. I believe in civil discourse and I believe we need citizens on this commission to listen to all of these points of view.

We need to hear from the people of Scottsdale when a new project comes up and that's write really feel that every voice needs to be heard before the planning commission advances projects to the council.

Vice Mayor Caputi: And I love what you are saying, but it's just hard for me to understand when you say you want to be a voice of reason without an ideological viewpoint or agenda, because every email we get from you is ideological development is destruction and the council and the P.C. are rubber stamps and we have blinders on. We are condescending. I mean it's all in the public record.

I appreciate that you say you are open minded and actually used the words "pro development" but yet every project is opposed when we get the emails. I'm having a hard time understanding how you would work as a team member of council and of planning commission after you have thrown what I felt was quite a few stones. So -- and I'm also wondering what metrics you are using to evaluate a project with -- you keep saying an open mind. I haven't had that experience.

Laurie Coe: I have been vocal about projects that I disagree with.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Is there a project that you have agreed with.

Laurie Coe: I haven't voiced any opinion about the projects you did approve. I respect the work that you do and I only speak out when I have an opposition, and I often feel that that opposition

isn't heard.

So I have been frustrated and I do feel that the planning commission is the bridge between the citizens from the city, to the planning commission, to the council for approval of plans. I'm not -- I'm really -- my only ideological opinion is that we need to preserve the peace and tranquility of our city. It's a beautiful town. It's suburban. I don't want to urbanize Scottsdale. So if that was an ideological position that is it. I don't want to see us urbanized.

Vice Mayor Caputi: I won't belabor the issue. Calling construction destruction is a bit ideological. I don't have any other questions. Does anyone have any questions? Thank you, Ms. Coe.

Mayor Ortega: I'm hoping we can have some brief questions and brief answers as we go forward.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Again, I think all of these commissions so important and we are hiring people who are going to have the job for two years. So I'm doing my best. Thank you. Mr. Fishman, would you like to approach the podium?

[Time: 00:49:30]

Rob Fishman: Mayor and councilmembers, my name is Rob Fishman. I live at 90 north 175th way, Scottsdale, it's in Stonegate, 85259. As a practical matter I have been on the board of Stonegate and an officer of Stonegate is over 900 resident homeowners association. I have lived in Scottsdale for ten years, and while I may not have architectural and engineering background, I have a background that I think is also very, very valuable.

I have been a CEO of public and private companies and I have been on the boards of public and private companies. I had to exercise and learn judgment over a long period of time. I was chief underwriting officer of Zurich North America and on the global underwriting team I assigned underwriting responsibilities to all of North America over 10,000 employees to give an example.

So the task that I see an important task of the planning that I see is how do you balance these issues. What is the process that you go through? So, for instance, members of this board have talked about certain concerns about what we need to do in Scottsdale.

As an example, heat mitigation, sustainability, emergency planning, housing get things done. Versus the priorities that you have also set forth which are value Scottsdale's long-term lifestyle, support economic vitality, enhance neighborhoods, preserve meaningful open space and advance transportation.

How do you take these competing interests in the context of a general plan and make smart decisions that are both economic and support the priorities that we have and at the same time

advance the interest with our citizens and also the economy going toward?

So, you know, the tradeoffs or projections -- I mean, for instance, you know, on the heat map, or how do we improve the brand for Scottsdale tourism, based upon the decisions we make on pieces of property across -- across the city. There's certain things that we must do. I call those must-dos. There are other things that are nice to have. There are other things that are aspirational and inspirational that really drive the results of a city. Its attraction to others.

So it's that detail, due diligence, lots of balance and judgment, understanding the mission, that I would bring to the planning commission. Thanks very much.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you, Mr. Fishman. Does anyone have any questions? You lucked out. I will hold my question for the moment. Could we have Mr. Heetland approach the podium. Please.

Jason Heetland: Thank you. It's a privilege to be here, my name is Jason Heetland, I'm a proud Scottsdale resident. I lived in that neighborhood for 19 years and I have been a Scottsdale resident pretty much my whole life, since I was about 2. My qualifications, I owned a business in downtown Scottsdale. I grew up in a family that owned a business in downtown Scottsdale.

[Time: 00:53:34]

After selling that business, went into public service and worked for the boys and girls club of greater Scottsdale. I'm a life member of the Scottsdale charros, graduate of class 17, Scottsdale leadership. I'm now a nonprofit executive, both with the sun YMCA and I work in their facilities in building management, as well as program management I lead with my heart. I love this city.

I come from the background as a person who has grown up here and went to Scottsdale public schools, who owned a business, who has worked and played in this beautiful city, and responsible growth, adhering to the character of the city, and the -- the city charter and master plan and working common sense development. Not all projects are good, not all projects are bad. There's common ground that needs to be found.

I lead with my heart and I lead with the -- with the will of the people and the business side of things. I think so many times there's divisiveness in our city and a lot of all development is good or all development is bad. I don't believe that. I'm more of a centrist. And I think the people who live here and the byes who operate here need to be consulted and listened to. And I pledge to talk to all of those people that will be affected by rejects and give you my best heartfelt judgment.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you, any questions?

Mayor Ortega: I should have asked it quick question.

Jason Heetland: Sure.

Mayor Ortega: Have you been to commission meetings?

Jason Heetland: Have I been to a commission meeting?

Mayor Ortega: That's all. I should have asked everyone.

Vice Mayor Caputi: I guess I had one quick similar question. I was wondering if you could bring -- maybe just one point about how your experience relates to planning commission, in particular, your ability to advise council on issues of planning and zoning.

Jason Heetland: Sure, as a small business owner and as a nonprofit executive, where our Dale I lives and our live -- daily lives and livelihood are affected by the planning and zoning and laws and decisions that the council makes and I approach this from a real citizen's point of view. I'm not a developer. I'm not a lawyer. I'm not an expert like the gentleman earlier, an architect. But those are the people that you consult with.

You consult with the common person, and the person who owns the business. And I feel like that's my strength find out what the people in the area, that are affected by this and how that affects the city in a macro sense, how we can move forward into the future Scottsdale that we need for sustainability and growth.

[Time: 00:56:56]

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you, Mr. Heetland, if there are not any other questions, I will call Ms. Higgs to the podium, please.

Renee Higgs: Good afternoon, Mayor Ortega, Vice Mayor Caputi and city councilmembers. My name is Renee Higgs. I live at 15192 north 104th way and I lived in Scottsdale approximately ten years. I stand here before you this afternoon, seeking your support for reappointment to the planning commission.

I have been honored to serve on this commission for the last three years, including the last year as chair. Prior to planning, I served as a member of the city's transportation commission, I have also held various volunteer leadership roles throughout the city with the Scottsdale chamber and Scottsdale leadership.

My career, however, is in marketing and outside of the realm of planning, zoning and architecture. Yet there's many aspects of the marketing roles I had that helped me. As the former regional marketing manager for the Mayo Clinic and senior marketing strategist for SRP, I have my finger on the pulse of economic development, residential and commercial growth and

unique insights on the status of the valley's water supply.

These insights have helped to paint for me a more comprehensive picture as the cases are presented to the planning commission. And all without think conflicts of interest or need for recusals. The tough issue facing the planning commission continues to be preparing for growth through responsible and thoughtful zoning and development.

With the success of our local economy and the volume of movers to the valley. Smart growth must be the focus and it needs to be viewed through the lens of balance. Balance of residential, business, economic and environmental needs. We need to protect the future of our city and maintain the tenets of its rich history. I believe I served on this commission as a rational, informed voice representing the balanced needs and varying perspectives of this great city and with that, I would like to ask for your vote for reappointment to continue to be voice. I thank you for your time and I'm happy to answer any questions.

Mayor Ortega: Quick question. Were you involved with the Old Town character area plan.

Renee Higgs: With the what?

Mayor Ortega: With the Old Town character area --

Renee Higgs: What was the last part that you said after that.

Mayor Ortega: Plan, either as a D.R. board member or --

Renee Higgs: No.

Mayor Ortega: And transportation commission?

Renee Higgs: Remember it coming -- I don't remember it coming through on transportation in the year and a half.

Mayor Ortega: We're in a situation where the council has asked to revisit because of excessive heights or density or whatever, that even the mapping that may be a question and that's the direction that we are this right now.

[Time: 01:00:11]

As a -- I don't want to say, do you consider yourself kind of insider to that whole program or do you feel that there are some things that need to be changed?

Renee Higgs: Insider? No, I don't know that I'm an insider to any specific case or super close to it. I treat them all individually and understand the components of each one. When it comes to

the Downtown character area plan, I do see that it has gone back out to residents to get -- and businesses to get some of their feedback.

I know there's some concerns with -- that have been addressed with the height and some density and multifamily as well. The multifamily one is tricky. That's another one where we need to look at balance because we do need to make sure that there's some sort of housing available for different types of members of our community.

So I don't -- I think it's good that it's being put back out this for the community and business owners to reevaluate and provide their -- or to take a look and provide their feedback.

Mayor Ortega: So at this time, you don't have any particular upon about height, density or how they impact on infrastructure or what is your opinion?

Renee Higgs: I don't have any specific details that I can go into while standing in front of us this evening, but I do think that it's important, again to have that balance of maintaining that rich history that Old Town has been known for, while still making sure that we can prepare for the future of the city as a whole.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Caputi: You have been a super valuable member of our planning commission and I appreciate your expertise and experience. Could you just tell us briefly how your experience on the planning commission and particularly as chair has made you a better commissioner and how you will use that experience going forward if you were to be appointed for another -- another term?

[Time: 01:02:11]

Renee Higgs: Yeah. Great question. I mean, I have certainly learned a whole lot in the three years that I served having come into this, you know, fairly new to planning zoning and development, but as much as I think that I have listened and heard the opinions of those within our community, I still think that I've learned even more about the varying opinions and sometimes misconceptions across our community regarding growth and development.

But as a commission member, I have always made sure to listen to the pro, no, and slow growth opinions shared throughout the city, with residents, business owners, staff, and councilmembers as well.

I think it's important to note that when I meet with applicants and zoning attorneys, I make sure to also ask both sides of, you know, what is it about this case and your project that will be a benefit to the city, and I also ask, what have been the biggest pushbacks from the community and what are you doing to address and mitigate those?

As chair I learned, it's an interesting position to be in, at the end of each case, I will be placing my vote, I still need to make sure -- it's imperative that I'm leading the commission discussions through an impartial and nonpolitical stance.

I think that's really important because really as a planning commission, we need to make sure that we are providing those recommendations on planning and zoning issues to you, the city council, to help you with your deliberations and make sure we have allowed for a healthy discussion with the facts and the opinions of all of those that have been involved.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Great. Thank you. Any other questions? Ms. Higgs? Ms. Joyner, would you like to approach the podium?

Michal Ann Joyner: Good afternoon, Mayor, Vice Mayor, city council. My name is Michal Ann Joyner. We lived here in Scottsdale for 22 years. And I'm a native Arizonan. I thank you for allowing me to speak today.

I consider the city of Scottsdale to be like a corporation and those of you sitting on council are the C.E.O.s of that corporation. And any time you are interviewing someone for a position, the first thing you do is look at their resume to see what they have done because what they have done is a good indicator of what they might do in the future.

While I do not have an engineering degree, I do have two master's degrees. And I have eight years of experience on the planning and zoning commission in the city of Chandler and I served as the chairman for four of those eight years. What is interesting about that is that I was reappointed by three consecutive mayors, and I was voted by all the city councils the last three times it was unanimous.

[Time: 01:05:23]

And you know how hard it is to get a unanimous vote from city council. I worked for two years on the planning -- or on the son the Chandler board of adjustment. I currently serve on the development review board and I do think experience does count. I have a reputation of working with developers and working with the citizens as well to get the throughout best product for the city of Scottsdale.

The biggest issue I see facing Scottsdale is not new. It's the same thing that it's been all along and that's balancing the needs of citizens, growth of the city, the vision for the city and the developers and meeting a budget. I see Scottsdale's downtown as the gem of the future. And I think it takes planning creativity and care. So I'm asking for your vote. I'm Michal Joyner.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you, Ms. Joyner. Questions from the council? Great. Pal we will now here from Diana Kaminski.

Diana Kaminski: Good evening, Mayor, Vice Mayor, councilman, my name is Diana Kaminski and I moved to Arizona from Michigan in 1980, and live in my current house at 8306 East Oak Street, 85257. For the last 20 years. I had a little interstitial space in downtown Tempe as I pursued a bachelor of science in design and a master's in public administration. My qualifications for this position are a little unique. I'm not aspiring to political position.

I have probably no chance of having a recusal conflict of interest. I actually work as a city planner and I have since 1985 in an adjacent community. All the way from building the town lake and writing first general plan to go to public election. And addressing density and intensification in the community. I also had the unique opportunity of going through the variance process in both cities as a resident and I encourage planners to have the opportunity to put themselves in the shoes of applicant and see what the applicants are going through when they approach the bench and ask for something from the community.

[Time: 01:08:10]

I also serve as a member of the Scottsdale troop 201 scout troop. I have worked on habitat for humanity builds and served intermittently with St. Mary's food bank and vista El Camino. I think the biggest issue is the balance land use issues and quality of life and we heard a little bit about that from some of the other applicants. We had about 14,000 new residential projects adopted since 2015.

A lot of those have been in south Scottsdale and we have to balance the need for attraction for jobs with the need for housing that's growing. That also includes looking at our water provisions at a time when we are asking people to cut back 5% of their use of water and making adoptions for additional housing.

And we are looking at road diets with the new transportation plan in south Scottsdale. So while we are asking for more increased density for housing in the southern area, we are reducing the size of the roads and asking for people to reduce their water consumption and so it's a balancing act.

We need to progress and go forward and protect the community that we have today. I appreciate the opportunity to speak with you today and I'm happy to answer any questions.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Any question from the council. I have one quick question. In the materials you sent to us, you said your top issue for the planning commission is that the citizens feel marginalized by new projects. And then you talk about value -- it's so interesting to see people at council only from your emails. Your emails are very opinionated and not very fact based.

I want to ask the question, when you talk about balance and compromise in your application which came up over and over. Could you give me an example of a project where you did listen

to all the perspectives and then compromised for the best outside?

Diana Kaminski: Since I haven't served on a board, I have not really had that opportunity. But I can give you an example. And like one of the other people that was applying in a case where I don't see any issues, I don't usually respond. On some projects I have provided feedback to the design review board with constructive recommendations of things and designs to make improvements to the design and in that case, I may this is a great project and here's how we can make it better.

I haven't really had a situation where I have been involved with working with the commission and residents in terms of a compromise but I did work with a group of residents would and I tried to help them understand the need for housing and what changes could be made that he they could get them to accept.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Again, there's a lot of people we hear from and it's just always problems and problems and, you know, again when you talk about balance, it's good to hear the good and the bad, and how you actually do come to a better project because I think that's the role of the planning commission.

Taking a project and meeting with the stakeholders and making the project better through compromise and balance. So, yes.

Does anyone have any questions.

Mayor Ortega: Councilman Durham and then Councilwoman Janik.

Councilmember Durham: Are you still a senior city planner with Tempe?

Diana Kaminski: I am.

[Time: 01:11:59]

Councilmember Durham: With all due respect to our neighbor to the south, Tempe's often portrayed as the place that we don't want to be. We don't want to look like Tempe. So what can you tell us that you have learned from your experience at Tempe, particularly the high-rise environment that would be able to assist you here in Scottsdale, where I think in general, I think it's safe to say the feeling is we don't want the same type of high-rise and dense environment that we see in Tempe. What have you learned that would help us?

Diana Kaminski: Well, do you have 20 hours? So with my time in Tempe, it's been very interesting and it's baptism by fire. I worked on the general plan 2020, which is the first general plan to go to state election -- or the election for the community through the state's growing smarter. The result of that effort was to actually separate the density map from the land use

map for full transparency of density throughout the city.

We also implemented what were called cultural resource areas in certain neighborhoods that aligned with the underlying zoning. So it didn't take property rights but it basically froze those neighborhoods from the intensification that was happening around them. A lot of community members were worried by the encroachment of development within the older areas of city. So we worked on trying to provide a balance that would accommodate the existing residence while the opportunities for intensification for properties around them.

We also looked at building heights. We have made a lot of changes to the zoning code. One the things we did in 2005, was require our design applications related to planned area developments to be joined to be heard at the city council. Rather than having separate boards the design review board and the planning commission, we combined them into one and they saw the design with the zoning standards being proposed because when you are talking about building height, and massing, that's really hard to visualize if you are not talking about the design.

So then those projects go forward to council, which adds a level of weight to those projects because now the commitment was before the council, with a promise of pretty pictures and if they want to change that, we have to go back through the public process. It added a level of transparency.

So I have worked very closely with neighborhoods on character area plans, looking at historic plant palettes and incorporating design elements into newer architecture and newer projects that may be a bigger scale. And it is a balancing act as I said. I did the first review of the -- the first high-rise in Tempe, west six and that came at the culmination of a recession and the project was shuttered in its construction state for three years.

And I'm involved with our economic development and looking at ways of attracting businesses and making sure we don't have vacant buildings, whether it's apartment building, condo or commercial center. Where can we add housing where it's necessary and it's a balancing act I have learned.

[Time: 01:15:25]

Vice Mayor Caputi: Councilwoman Janik.

Councilmember Janik: Thank you. Have you received great diversity of opinion in Tempe on some of the projects have you undertaken?

Diana Kaminski: Oh, yes.

Councilmember Janik: Okay. And then I ask that but I was pretty sure you did. My next question

is how do you get the people to work together to come up with the best project so for the most part, you get everybody to buy into that project?

Diana Kaminski: I don't think you will always make everyone happy, right? There was a wise person that said if you make everybody happy, you are not doing your job. But I think the idea is to get consensus with as many as you can and bringing people in on or the process early and listing as objectively as you can what their key issues are and looking for what things they would be willing to balance.

So maybe x number of housing someone is too much, but maybe this would go through. So that neighborhood meeting is really, really important. And if the development community takes to heart what those residents are saying and they listen to them and they say, oh, yeah, we can work with this.

Then they are moving forward and they are able to say we listened to the community and this is what we have come forward with. Instead of a feeling of disenfranchisement where the neighbors continue to say the same thing over and over and don't feel like they are being heard. I think there's a case that's coming back to you guys that's been asked to be continued and changed names.

So the level of transparency is gone. It disappeared and off the agenda and it pops up as a new project with a new name. And I think that adds to the frustration. Keeping it transparent, keeping it open, I think really helps.

[Time: 01:17:21]

Councilmember Janik: Then one last question. Obviously, we have a group of people that are always no and another group that are always yes. When you talk to the always no people, do you get them to come to a point where they will say what they do agree with? What they might want to see? In other words, no, this is too much, but there is a positive side to it and you can get some concessions?

Diana Kaminski: That really depends on the applicant. Because my role as a city planner is not to facilitate that relationship necessarily. I can make suggestions and I can ask questions, but ultimately, it's up to the developer to come up with a way of making that happen. So I do what I can within the parameters. I can't being an advocate for the project and I can't be an advocate for the nay sayers. It's the balancing act I have. I will ask questions and say, you know, I heard you say this. Would you consider this and then it's up to them to figure that out.

Councilmember Janik: Okay. Thank you very much. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Any other questions? And yet you have been an advocate in the past for nay-sayers. Okay. Thank you very much.

Diana Kaminski: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Could we have Ed Peaser, please.

Ed Peaser: Good afternoon, Mayor, Vice Mayor, members of the council. My name is Ed Peaser. I live at 8413 east rosewood lane 85251, and I have lived here in that house for the last 55 years. I love living in Scottsdale and I really have never given any thought to living anywhere else. You asked about in the three questions, you ask about the experience.

I wanted to say I worked in construction for 54 years, serving as a building inspector for 38 of those years and I have nine international code council certifications. I caught all the building codes, construction methods and inspection technique classes at Scottsdale community college.

I worked in the planning and development department in Scottsdale from 1984 to 2015, specifically in the building department. In 1985, the city leaders determined they needed someone to inspect buildings to verify that the DRB stipulations in the planning commission development standards had been adhered to and completed before using or before issuing the occupancy. I maintained those duties until 1996.

[Time: 01:20:36]

I served as deputy building official from 2005 to 2015 and I oversaw the building plan review department, one of my duties was to serve as the board of appeals. I assisted the board with motions Robert's rules, et cetera. I wrote all the building code amendments and presented those to the building advisory board of appeals for their recommendation to council. In 2015, after I retired, I applied for and I was appointed to the building advisory board. I served on four of those years.

I'm familiar with the general plan 2035 to understand how the supporting elements are applied and incorporated into the land use element. As a city employee, and board member, it's always been my goal to serve the citizens of Scottsdale. My term with the building advisory board ended last September and I'm hoping to continue my service to the community with this commission.

As far as the top issue and listening to all the comments tonight. It's -- it's hard to pick, but I think the top issue facing the planning commission is to provide our citizens with a quality development whether it's commercial, resident or multifamily that meet all of our design standards.

With people moving here every day, whether they are citizens or moving their businesses here, the board's attention to new development, whether it be older, developed properties that are being removed into a modern new building is being built in its place or upgrading older

properties to meet modern standards is essential.

All properties need to meet the city standard, are well designed and particularly sensitive to the surrounding neighborhoods. Thank you for the nomination and the opportunity to come before you and possibly serve the citizens of Scottsdale again.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you, Mr. Peaser. Are there any questions. I will entertain a vote for the planning commission. Each councilmember can vote for two nominees. And I believe we are up to Councilwoman Whitehead.

[Time: 01:22:53]

Councilmember Whitehead: Thank you. So first of all, I just want to say wow. I want to thank every single one of you. What an impressive list of candidates. I'm just grateful. I always say you can't believe who you will find behind doors in this town. I will call out Mr. Brand, who I had pleasure of working with. Cities around the world are hiring him, and we are getting him for free. Thank you for helping us all the time and sometimes for pay.

What I'm hearing very clearly is that we do want to bring in new blood so to speak. We want to bring people would have the ability to understand the projects and negotiate for better projects and ask meaningful questions and give us good guidance. But are, in fact, regular citizens.

So I do want to say, everybody leave your name in the hat, but I am going to go ahead and I also like to get my money's worth. So we have the opportunity to keep people for six years and, remember, they are actually free but they learn a lot in the first term. So I will go ahead and vote to reappoint Renee Higgs and I'm going to give my second vote to Mr. Robert Fishman, but, please, keep your names in the hat. You guys are amazing.

Councilmember Milhaven: Mr. Brand and Ms. Higgs.

Mayor Ortega: Diana Kaminski and Ed Peaser.

Councilmember Littlefield: Laurie Coe and Michal Ann Joyner.

Councilmember Janik: Diana Kaminski and Ed Peaser.

Councilmember Durham: I second Councilmember Whitehead's comments about the quality of all the applicants, many outstanding applicants but the two that I'm going to pick are Renee Higgs and Diana Kaminski.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Agree, this was an exceptional group of applicants and I'm going to vote for Jeff brand and Renee Higgs.

So we have, I believe, Renee Higgs and Diana Kaminski, is that right, Rommel?

Rommel Cordova: So Ms. Higgs is reappointed. We will note her. As appointed. Mr. Heetland did not receive any votes and so he will be removed from the listing here. You had Ms. Kaminski and Jeff Brand and Ed Peaser and you would revote amongst those three since they were the three top.

[Time: 01:26:12]

Vice Mayor Caputi: Tell me the names again.

Rommel Cordova: Mr. Brand, Mr. Kaminski and Mr. Peaser.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Okay. I will just -- well, let's just go in order.

Rommel Cordova: Just one moment to clear the screen.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Yes, sure.

Rommel Cordova: Okay. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Great. Jeff brand and Ed Peaser.

Rommel Cordova: Vice Mayor, you can only vote for one.

Vice Mayor Caputi: It's never worked out like this before. I have to leave with a bang. I vote for Jeff brand.

Councilmember Whitehead: Diana Kaminski.

Councilmember Milhaven: Mr. Brand.

Mayor Ortega: Diana Kaminski.

Councilmember Littlefield: Diana Kaminski.

Councilmember Janik: Diana Kaminski.

Councilmember Durham: Diana Kaminski.

Vice Mayor Caputi: It looks like we have Diana Kaminski appointed. Thank you.

TOURISM DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

[Time: 01:27:35]

Vice Mayor Caputi: The Tourism Development Commission advises the City Council on matters concerning the expenditure of revenues from the Transaction Privilege Tax on transient lodging, bed tax, Designated for tourism development.

Special Qualifications: As specified in the Scottsdale City Code, the Tourism Development Commission shall consist of representatives of the tourism industry in Scottsdale, including a minimum of four Scottsdale hoteliers, one member of the Scottsdale Convention and Visitors Bureau, and a balance from elements of the tourism industry. There is one Scottsdale hotelier position vacancy and one Nominee. The nominee is: Steve Jung. If you could please approach the podium. And is it Jung or "young." Really in it's completely different.

Steve Jung: I into you that was going to happen.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Right?

Steve Jung: My name is Steve Jung and I reside at 7955 east Chaparral road, 85250. I just moved there, actually just a few months ago but I have owned a residence in Scottsdale for the past ten years.

I'm currently the general of the Embassy Suite by Hilton Scottsdale resort. The hotel is part of the Hilton family of brands but it's owned by a long-time' resident. I have been in the hospitality industry for over 30 years in several markets including Chicago, Indianapolis, Portland, and most recently Sonoma County.

Tourism plays an important part of our economy, and I feel as a business leader, it's important to have a voice and help shape the future of our industry and do it in a sustainable fashion. As a resident living mine unites to Old Town, I understand the need to market to high-worth individuals.

Serving my community has been important to me and in my past positions Sonoma County and Portland, I was part of the destination marketing organizations and served as board chair for Sonoma County and travel Portland. In Portland, I worked closely with the leadership at travel Portland to develop the tourism improvement district, increasing the marketing funds from \$8 million to \$16 million annually.

In Sonoma County I worked closely with the C.E.O. to transition from a destination marketing organization to a destination stewardship organization. Expanding the mission of the organization to include community outreach fire emergency planning and pandemic recovery plans. I think the biggest issue for me coming to this market, fairly new, is especially coming from Sonoma County is to make sure that we support events and initiatives that are both good

for the financial sense for Scottsdale, but also for the community itself.

I have seen tourism go sideways. I have just moved here but I have been coming here for 30 years. I appreciate the opportunity to serve Scottsdale.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Thank you. Any questions. Okay. I will now entertain a vote for the tourism development commission.

[Time: 01:30:55]

Councilmember Milhaven: Mr. Jung.

Mayor Ortega: Steve Jung.

Councilmember Littlefield: Jung.

Councilmember Janik: Jung.

Councilmember Durham: Mr. Jung.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Mr. Jung.

Councilmember Whitehead: Steve Jung.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Mr. Jung, you have been appointed. Congratulations. There is one Industry position Vacancy and one nominee. The nominee is: Jeanne Alspaugh. Ms. Alspaugh's term expires this month and is eligible for reappointment. She is unable to join us this afternoon, but very much would like to be reappointed to the commission.

She submitted written correspondence for Council review prior to today's meeting. So I will just entertain a vote for the tourism development commission tree's representative opening and why don't we start with the Mayor.

Mayor Ortega: Jeanne Alspaugh.

Councilmember Littlefield: Jeanne Alspaugh.

Councilmember Janik: Jeanne Alspaugh.

Councilmember Durham: Jeanne Alspaugh.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Jeanne Alspaugh.

Councilmember Whitehead: Jeanne Alspaugh.

Councilmember Milhaven: Jeanne Alspaugh.

Vice Mayor Caputi: Perfect.

Jeanne Alspaugh has been appointed. This concludes our appointment process for today. I would like to thank all our nominees for their interest in serving on a city board or commission. We are fortunate to continue to receive qualified applicants for the positions on our Boards and Commissions.

Even if you were not appointed today, your application will remain on file for consideration at a future date if there are additional vacancies. City staff will contact the individuals appointed this evening and provide them with information on next steps regarding their appointment. The City of Scottsdale is very fortunate to have such dedicated and talented individuals who are willing and ready to serve for our city. Back to you, Mayor.

[Time: 01:32:54]

Mayor Ortega: Thank you, Vice Mayor. And thank you for serving eight months with the Vice Mayor duties. Commencing June 1st, Tom Durham will serve as Vice Mayor. I will ask for a motion to adjourn the city council special meeting.

Councilmember Janik: So moved.

Councilwoman Whitehead: Second.

Mayor Ortega: Thank you. All in favor register your vote. Thank you. We are adjourned.