

Detailed Follow Up Report - Auditor Determined Status

| Rec# | Recommendation | Auditor FollowUp | City Auditor's Status | Closed |
|------|---|---|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 1905 | Infrastructure Condition Assessment | Issued: | 6/14/2019 | |
| 1A | <p>The Public Works Division Director should require policies and procedures be developed and implemented to ensure that the City's bridge conditions are assessed and the bridges maintained. Specifically, these policies and procedures should require staff to create work orders for the ADOT inspection recommendations, then prioritize and complete the work orders timely.</p> | <p>Oct 2019: Division management reported that the City Engineer and Street Operations staff reviewed the 2018 ADOT inspection reports and assigned recommended maintenance or repair items to the appropriate staff. Auditors reviewed the report binders in which the City Engineer flagged projects to indicate items that should be evaluated by CPM, such as being evaluated for a capital project, or should be addressed by Street Operations. The Street Operations staff plans to enter the applicable pending work into their work order system although this has not yet been completed. Auditors also reviewed a tracking spreadsheet that Street Operations created from the ADOT bridge inventory to note which department is responsible for any needed repairs and to track completion. Specific policies and procedures, such as how to document, prioritize and monitor the work, have not yet been developed. May 2020: The department reported that a new update policy has been created outlining the progression of review for ADOT findings. Auditors will review the policies and procedures for a future update. Sept 2020: The department established basic procedures for reviewing the ADOT inspections and working with the City Engineer to prioritize them. However, policies and procedures still do not address timely completion of the work. The department currently reports having entered work orders for about half the 2018 inspections and was not actively monitoring their completion. As well, it has not yet reviewed ADOT's 2019 or 2020 inspection reports. March 2021: The department director is following up on the status of the more recent inspection reports. Sept 2021: Auditors observed that ADOT is now providing inspection reports online and sending notifications when they are available - which reduces the risk of the inspection report disk being misplaced. The Streets department is still managing review and work order prioritization manually until a technology-based solution can be resolved. As a result, status reports do not include all ADOT bridge inspection recommendations. Apr 2022: While using a largely manual process, the department is now more consistently reviewing bridge</p> | Implemented | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |

Detailed Follow Up Report - Auditor Determined Status

| Rec# | Recommendation | Auditor FollowUp | City Auditor's Status | Closed |
|------|--|--|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| | | inspection reports and generating work orders. (Since 2020, 63 work orders related to the ADOT inspections had been completed and 88 were currently pending.) The manager monitors progress by tracking the work orders filed in binders and tabbed for status. | | |
| 1B | The Public Works Division Director should require policies and procedures be developed and implemented to ensure that the City's bridge conditions are assessed and the bridges maintained. Specifically, these policies and procedures should require staff to report bridge construction and rehabilitation projects to ADOT in accordance with the bridge inspection program requirements and review ADOT's City of Scottsdale bridge inventory to properly identify any privately-owned bridges on the list. | Oct 2019: Division management reported that the City Engineer communicated with ADOT to determine the process for reporting bridges to be added to NBIS, and CPM is in the process of adding the new 68th St and Pima Rd bridges. CPM staff developed and provided a list of bridges completed within the last 10 years, but Street Operations staff explained they did not realize they were to be comparing this list to the ADOT inventory to determine what needs to be reported. This comparison has not yet been completed. Policies and procedures have not yet been developed to formalize the bridge inventory processes. May 2020: The department reported that the City Engineer has coordinated with ADOT to determine requirements and the process for adding bridges to the NBIS inventory. They have submitted some bridges to ADOT for addition and are adding the NBIS inventory to an LIS layer to simplify the comparison to CPM's bridge information. Sept 2020: The department reported a delay in developing the LIS layer due to a software environment transition. The web map is expected to be completed in October to facilitate a full comparison to ADOT's bridge inventory. March 2021: The updated procedure does not clearly assign responsibilities to responsible units or positions, and details of the review for privately-owned structures on the City's inventory were not yet provided. Sept 2021: The City Engineer reviewed the ADOT inventory and identified private structures and some that will require additional verification. CPM staff have been instructed to report new bridge construction to ADOT and evaluate past projects for the need to report. Procedures still need clarification on the specific responsibilities that are shared between CPM and Streets. Mar 2022: The department stated maintenance and repairs of NBIS and non-NBIS bridges will be the responsibility of the Street Operations Manager. While the previous City Engineer had identified privately-owned and retired bridges and added new | Part Impl'd | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |

Detailed Follow Up Report - Auditor Determined Status

| Rec# | Recommendation | Auditor FollowUp | City Auditor's Status | Closed |
|------|---|---|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| | | structures to the ADOT inventory, there is still not a plan to complete an inventory of the City's non-NBIS bridges. | | |
| 1C | The Public Works Division Director should require policies and procedures be developed and implemented to ensure that the City's bridge conditions are assessed and the bridges maintained. Specifically, these policies and procedures should require staff to inventory Scottsdale's non-NBIS bridge structures and establish a program for regularly inspecting, maintaining and repairing them. | Oct 2019: Division management reported that Street Operations is currently determining if there are structures not in the NBIS database and determining whether these should be added or tracked separately. However, Street Operations staff was not aware of this responsibility and had not yet started identifying non-NBIS structures. Auditors explained available resources that may be helpful in performing this task. May 2020: The department reported they are working to add the NBIS inventory to an LIS layer to simplify the comparison to CPM's bridge information. Once this is done, all structures that meet the requirements will be submitted to ADOT for inclusion in the NBIS inventory and inspections, maintenance and repairs will be reported as required. Sept 2020: The LIS layer project is still underway for comparison to the ADOT bridge inventory. The department does not currently have a plan for inspecting non-NBIS bridges. March 2021: The department has not yet provided further details on the status of this recommended improvement. Sept 2021: The department has not yet provided further details on the status of this recommendation. Mar 2022: The department plans to inventory the non-NBIS bridges every 2 years, although a complete current inventory has not yet been compiled. Also, the inspection plans are preliminary with little detail. | Part Impl'd | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| 2A | The Public Works Division Director should require staff to reassess the parking garage assessment program to evaluate the five-year inspection goal based on current observed conditions. Also, require staff to create, prioritize and timely complete work orders for the parking garage structural assessment recommendations. | Oct 2019: Division management reported that the Facilities Director is assessing the current garage assessment program to validate the interval and that, for assessments completed to date, repairs have been identified and funded or are pending future budget approvals. The Facilities director reported she still considers the current 5-year goal and assessment schedule feasible. Facilities also noted that 3 assessed parking garages are budgeted to be repaired this fiscal year, beginning around January 2020. May 2020: The department reported that structural assessments are scheduled on a 5-year cycle, and two assessments were completed this fiscal year as scheduled. Repairs to one garage are in progress, but another has been deferred to FY | Implemented | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |

Detailed Follow Up Report - Auditor Determined Status

| Rec# | Recommendation | Auditor FollowUp | City Auditor's Status | Closed |
|------|--|--|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| | | <p>2020/21. Auditors will review supporting documentation for a future update. Sept 2020: The current Facilities Management director was not familiar with this pending issue but will review it. March 2021: The department has scheduled assessments to meet the goal of 5-year reviews. In addition, garage repair work orders have been created, such as pending work for the One Civic Center garage.</p> | | |
| 2B | <p>The Public Works Division Director should require staff to ensure that the City’s drainage assets are properly inspected and maintained. In particular, require staff to create, prioritize and timely complete maintenance work orders for concerns identified by ADOT inspection reports.</p> | <p>Oct 2019: Division management reported that for the short term, Street Operations will coordinate with the Parks & Recreation department for help with drainage assets within the parks and for the longer term, Street Operations will seek funding for an added position. Auditors explained to Street Operations staff the need to monitor actual inspection progress against the goal and that combining the related structural assets recorded in the database into structures may simplify monitoring, avoid input errors and improve inspection data quality. May 2020: The department reported that it was not able to add additional staffing through FY 2020/21, so Parks staff is assisting with maintenance while Transportation & Streets is doing the inspections. Further, the department reported 50% completion of the recommended repairs from the latest ADOT inspection as of 5/1/2020. Auditors will review supporting documentation for a future update. Sept 2020: No changes have yet been made to the drainage inspection process. As well, reports were not available to confirm management's reported 50% completion status on ADOT maintenance recommendations. Instead, department staff indicated about half of ADOT's 2018 recommended maintenance has been entered into the work order system, but they have not been monitoring the work order completion status. March 2021: The department requested 2 additional employees for drainage inspection, but did not yet evaluate whether inspection targets could, instead, be prioritized based on criticality. Sept 2021: The department reported it is hiring an additional employee to perform drainage inspections. All assets will be expected to be inspected annually, and training is being provided to encourage consistent recording of inspections.</p> | In Progress | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |

Detailed Follow Up Report - Auditor Determined Status

| Rec# | Recommendation | Auditor FollowUp | City Auditor's Status | Closed |
|------|--|---|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 2C | <p>The Public Works Division Director should require staff to complete the streetlight inventory reconciliation and the sidewalk inventory and establish appropriate condition assessment and maintenance programs. As well, require staff to establish an appropriate parking lot condition assessment and maintenance program.</p> | <p>Oct 2019: Division management reported that Street Operations is working with utility providers to validate streetlight inventories and is developing a budget request to get resources to assess alleys and parking lots and develop a 5-year investment plan. May 2020: Division management reported that the department is continuing to make progress on the streetlight inventory. Resources were not funded for a system-wide sidewalk inventory and parking lot assessments in FY 2020/21, so the department's current focus is known sidewalk and concrete repair needs.</p> | Part Impl'd | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |